



CITY OF PLATTSBURGH
PLANNING BOARD
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT OFFICE

James A. Abdallah, Chairman
Richard Perry, Member
Reginald Carter, Member
Curt Gervich, Member
Abby Meuser-Herr

Tom Cosgro, Alt.
Elisha Bartlett, Senior Planner
Shelise Marbut, Planning Asst.
Barbara Brister, Sr. Clerk

Planning Board Minutes

Monday, November 28, 2022; 6:00 PM | (Work Session at 5:30pm)

Common Council Chambers
41 City Hall Place
Plattsburgh, NY 12901

Pledge of Allegiance

Roll Call: James A. Abdallah (Chair), Rick Perry, Abby Meuser-Herr, Tom Cosgro (Alternate)

Staff Present: Shelise Marbut (Planning Assistant)

Excused: Reg Carter, Curt Gervich, Elisha Bartlett (Senior Planner), Barbara Brister (Senior Clerk)

A. Monthly Project Review

1. PB# 22-16, 13 Macomb Street Historic Site Review (Darrah Roof)

Project Description: Request to replace an existing asphalt shingle roof with a black steel standing seam roof on a non-contributing property located at 13 Macomb Street within the Point Historic District (TMP #207.20-2-25). The property is zoned R2.

Applicant: Kristin Darrah

Plan Preparer: Kristin Darrah

- A. Public Hearing
- B. Motion to adopt SEQRA resolution 22-16A.

Moved By: Rick Perry Seconded By: Tom Cosgro
Discussion: N/A
Roll Call: Jim Abdallah, Rick Perry, Abby Meuser-Herr, Tom Cosgro

ACTION TAKEN: Adopted Defeated Withdrawn Tabled

- C. Motion to adopt project resolution 22-16B.

Moved By: Rick Perry Seconded By: Tom Cosgro
Discussion: The board noted that this property is a non-contributing property to the historic district; the testimony of the applicant was that the proposal would complement the surrounding properties; the applicant has stated that the roof is currently leaking; and the comment letter from SHPO states that the agency has no substantial concerns with the proposed roof replacement.
Roll Call: Jim Abdallah, Rick Perry, Abby Meuser-Herr, Tom Cosgro

ACTION TAKEN: Adopted Defeated Withdrawn Tabled

2. PB# 22-17, 124 U.S. Oval Historic Site Review (Bracy Fence)

Project Description: Request to erect an ornamental aluminum fence located at 124 U.S. Oval within the Oval Historic District (TMP #221.12-2-2.1). The property is zoned R2.

Owner/Applicant: Jackie and Evan Bracy

Project Representative: Jody Emery, C&E Fencing

- A. Public Hearing
- B. Motion to adopt SEQRA resolution 22-17A.

Moved By: Abby Meuser-Herr Seconded By: Rick Perry
 Discussion: N/A
 Roll Call: Jim Abdallah, Rick Perry, Abby Meuser-Herr, Tom Cosgro

ACTION TAKEN: Adopted Defeated Withdrawn Tabled

- C. Motion to adopt project resolution 22-17B.

Moved By: Rick Perry Seconded By: Abby Meuser-Herr
 Discussion: The board noted that this property is located on a corner lot, however, the proposed improvements are not within the corner area subject to corner lot restrictions.
 The board further noted that the contractor should take caution when digging posts for the fence and coordinate with Dig Safe due to the presence of the sanitary sewer line.
 The applicant stated that easements on the property will be accommodated.
 The board requested that the contractor terminate the fences on a post and not attach the fence to the building. A small attachment may be necessary but should not impair the character or materials of the building.
 The board applied a condition that the applicant must coordinate with the Community Development Office to adhere to any SHPO recommendations that occur within the referral period and further conditioned that the installation of the fences shall not cause damage to the building.
 Roll Call: Jim Abdallah, Rick Perry, Abby Meuser-Herr, Tom Cosgro

ACTION TAKEN: Adopted Defeated Withdrawn Tabled

B. Other Business

- A. Status Updates by Staff (if applicable)

C. Adjournment

Resolution No. 22-16A

Motioned by: Rick Perry

WHEREAS, the City of Plattsburgh's Planning Board has before it a project known as:

13 Macomb St: Request to replace an existing asphalt shingle roof with a black steel standing seam roof on a non-contributing property located at 13 Macomb Street within the Point Historic District (TMP #207.20-2-25). The property is zoned R2; Applicant: Kristin Darrah; Plan Preparer: Kristin Darrah;

SEQR DETERMINATION; and

WHEREAS, Part 617 of the Environmental Conservation Law - "State Environmental Quality Review Act" (SEQRA), provides for the review of any "ACTION" to determine the effect of the action on the environment, along with any related administrative procedures for the implementation, authorization or approval of the action; and

WHEREAS, said Part 617 of the Environmental Conservation Law provides for an involved agency to review any action for the purpose of determining the effect of the action on the environment; and

WHEREAS, public comment opportunity was provided in consideration of this Project on November 28, 2022; and

WHEREAS, the City's Community Development Office received and reviewed the Historic Site Review application, supplemental documentation, and SEQRA Part 1 Short EAF; and

WHEREAS, the City's Planning Board reviewed the information filed with the application for the Project, including but not limited to the EAF Part 1 and additional information provided to supplement and clarify the same; and

WHEREAS, the City's Planning Board conducted a detailed and comprehensive environmental review of the Project to determine whether there was a significant impact which would require the preparation of a Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS);

Now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that the City's Planning Board does hereby determine that the project is an Unlisted ACTION in accordance with said Environmental Review procedures and a coordinated review will not be done; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the City's Planning Board acting as the "Lead Agency" in a SEQRA Review does hereby receive and place on file the Historic Site Review applications, supplemental documentation, completed EAF and other related material submitted; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Board has reviewed the Community Development Office's recommendations and supplemental documents referenced above and does hereby find and determine that the Project does not:

- a) involve a substantial adverse change in existing air quality, ground or surface water quality, traffic or noise levels, solid waste production, potential for erosion, flooding or drainage problems;
- b) involve the removal or destruction of large quantities of vegetation or the interference with plant or animal life or impacts on a significant habitat area; substantial adverse impacts on a threatened or endangered species of plant or animal, or the habitat area of such species, or other significant adverse impacts to natural resources,
- c) conflict with the City's current plans or goals for the area where the project is located
- d) impair the character or quality of the neighborhood;
- e) represent a major change in the use of energy;
- f) create any hazards to human health;
- g) represent a substantial change in the use of the land;
- h) significantly increase the number of people who would come to the site absent such development; or
- i) impair the environmental characteristics of the area; and, *it is further*

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Board of the City of Plattsburgh after review of the said_Historic Site Review application, completed EAF, and related materials does hereby determine as "Lead Agency" for the SEQRA Review process that the "Project" will not have a significant effect on the environment. Therefore, the preparation of a DEIS is not required; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Board does hereby declare that the Project and environmental review process considered for the development does adequately and sufficiently satisfy the requirements of the State Environmental Quality Review Act for the Project; and be it further

RESOLVED, that a copy of this resolution be forwarded to other involved agencies who may be reviewing the Project for their records and files, and that the attached negative declaration be filed accordingly.

RESOLVED, that the Planning Board of the City of Plattsburgh does hereby authorize and direct the Chairman of the Planning Board to have prepared and to execute a "Notice of No Significant Environmental Impact" (NEGATIVE DECLARATION) for this "Project"; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the "Notice of No Significant Impact" (NEGATIVE DECLARATION) shall be disseminated to those involved Agencies and Governmental Units as required by said Environmental Conservation and Local Law of the City of Plattsburgh and all related material shall be maintained on file at the City Hall Offices of the Planning Board and available for Public Inspection.

Seconded By: Tom Cosgro

Discussion & Conditions (Not Verbatim):

	<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Roll Call:				
Jim Abdallah	X			
Rick Perry	X			
Reg Carter			X	
Curt Gervich,			X	
Abby Meuser-Herr	X			
Tom Cosgro (Alt)	X			

Carried: 4-0-0

Resolution No. 22-16B

Motion by: Rick Perry

WHEREAS, the City Planning Board has received and reviewed a request for Planning Board approval of a historic site modification for:

13 Macomb St: Request to replace an existing asphalt shingle roof with a black steel standing seam roof on a non-contributing property located at 13 Macomb Street within the Point Historic District (TMP #207.20-2-25). The property is zoned R2; Applicant: Kristin Darrah; Plan Preparer: Kristin Darrah;

HISTORIC SITE REVIEW; and

WHEREAS, the site is in the Court St. Historic District and is subject to historic site review per Zoning Code Section 360-32; and

WHEREAS, the historic site review application and associated materials have been reviewed by the City's Public Works, Building Inspector, Environmental Services, Emergency Services and Municipal Lighting Departments who did not have any additional comment; and

WHEREAS, the historic site review application and related materials have been reviewed by the City's Community Development Office which has submitted a staff report dated November 16, 2022 to the Planning Board for the Planning Board's consideration; and

WHEREAS, public hearing for the said project was held on November 28, 2022 in accordance with the City of Plattsburgh's *Zoning Code* Section 360-56; and now, therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the City of Plattsburgh Planning Board does hereby:

- A. Receive and place on file the said Community Development Office's staff report dated November 16, 2022; and
- B. Concur with the said items and recommendations contained in the said Community Development Office's staff report dated November 16, 2022; and be it further

RESOLVED, that unless otherwise extended by the Planning Board this historic site review decision shall expire upon the following occurrences:

- A. The applicant fails to undertake the proposed action or project; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Planning Board does hereby establish the following additional conditions of approval:

- A. Subject to the project complying with all Permit requirements; and

- B. Subject to the applicant complying with any requirements of the Planning Board noted in the Planning Board Resolution discussion; and

RESOLVED, that upon the applicant completing all of the above requirements the City's Community Development Office is hereby authorized to transmit one copy of the executed Historic Site Review Approval notice to the applicant and a copy to the City's Building Inspector informing him that the application and supporting materials are in compliance with the City's Planning Board requirements, including any comments noted within the "Discussion" below;

Seconded By: Tom Cosgro

Discussion & Conditions (Not Verbatim):

The board notes that this property is a non-contributing property to the historic district. The board further notes that it is the testimony of the applicant that the proposed roof will complement neighboring properties within the district. The board also notes that the applicant has stated the roof is currently leaking and the SHPO response indicates that the agency has no substantial concerns.

Roll Call:	<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Jim Abdallah	X			
Rick Perry	X			
Reg Carter			X	
Curt Gervich,			X	
Abby Meuser-Herr	X			
Tom Cosgro (Alt)	X			

Carried: 4-0-0

Resolution No. 22-17A

Motioned by: Abby Meuser-Herr

WHEREAS, the City of Plattsburgh's Planning Board has before it a project known as:

124 U.S. Oval: Request to erect an ornamental aluminum fence located at 124 U.S. Oval within the Oval Historic District (TMP #221.12-2-2.1). Zoned R2; Tax Map Parcel ID #221.12-2-2.1; Applicant: Evan & Jackie Bracy; Plan Preparer: CE Fencing

SEQR DETERMINATION; and

WHEREAS, Part 617 of the Environmental Conservation Law - "State Environmental Quality Review Act" (SEQRA), provides for the review of any "ACTION" to determine the effect of the action on the environment, along with any related administrative procedures for the implementation, authorization or approval of the action; and

WHEREAS, said Part 617 of the Environmental Conservation Law provides for an involved agency to review any action for the purpose of determining the effect of the action on the environment; and

WHEREAS, public comment opportunity was provided in consideration of this Project on November 28, 2022; and

WHEREAS, the City's Community Development Office received and reviewed the Historic Site Review application, supplemental documentation, and SEQRA Part 1 Short EAF; and

WHEREAS, the City's Planning Board reviewed the information filed with the application for the Project, including but not limited to the EAF Part 1 and additional information provided to supplement and clarify the same; and

WHEREAS, the City's Planning Board conducted a detailed and comprehensive environmental review of the Project to determine whether there was a significant impact which would require the preparation of a Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS);

Now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that the City's Planning Board does hereby determine that the project is an Unlisted ACTION in accordance with said Environmental Review procedures and a coordinated review will not be done; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the City's Planning Board acting as the "Lead Agency" in a SEQRA Review does hereby receive and place on file the Historic Site Review applications, supplemental documentation, completed EAF and other related material submitted; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Board has reviewed the Community Development Office's recommendations and supplemental documents referenced above and does hereby find and determine that the Project does not:

- a) involve a substantial adverse change in existing air quality, ground or surface water quality, traffic or noise levels, solid waste production, potential for erosion, flooding or drainage problems;
- b) involve the removal or destruction of large quantities of vegetation or the interference with plant or animal life or impacts on a significant habitat area; substantial adverse impacts on a threatened or endangered species of plant or animal, or the habitat area of such species, or other significant adverse impacts to natural resources,
- c) conflict with the City's current plans or goals for the area where the project is located
- d) impair the character or quality of the neighborhood;
- e) represent a major change in the use of energy;
- f) create any hazards to human health;
- g) represent a substantial change in the use of the land;
- h) significantly increase the number of people who would come to the site absent such development; or
- i) impair the environmental characteristics of the area; and, *it is further*

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Board of the City of Plattsburgh after review of the said_Historic Site Review application, completed EAF, and related materials does hereby determine as "Lead Agency" for the SEQRA Review process that the "Project" will not have a significant effect on the environment. Therefore, the preparation of a DEIS is not required; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Board does hereby declare that the Project and environmental review process considered for the development does adequately and sufficiently satisfy the requirements of the State Environmental Quality Review Act for the Project; and be it further

RESOLVED, that a copy of this resolution be forwarded to other involved agencies who may be reviewing the Project for their records and files, and that the attached negative declaration be filed accordingly.

RESOLVED, that the Planning Board of the City of Plattsburgh does hereby authorize and direct the Chairman of the Planning Board to have prepared and to execute a "Notice of No

Significant Environmental Impact" (NEGATIVE DECLARATION) for this "Project"; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the "Notice of No Significant Impact" (NEGATIVE DECLARATION) shall be disseminated to those involved Agencies and Governmental Units as required by said Environmental Conservation and Local Law of the City of Plattsburgh and all related material shall be maintained on file at the City Hall Offices of the Planning Board and available for Public Inspection.

Seconded By: Rick Perry

Discussion & Conditions (Not Verbatim):

Roll Call:	<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Jim Abdallah	X			
Rick Perry	X			
Reg Carter			X	
Curt Gervich,			X	
Abby Meuser-Herr	X			
Tom Cosgro (Alt)	X			

Carried: 4-0-0

Resolution No. 22-17B

Motion by: Rick Perry

WHEREAS, the City Planning Board has received and reviewed a request for Planning Board approval of a historic site modification for:

124 U.S. Oval: Request to erect an ornamental aluminum fence located at 124 U.S. Oval within the Oval Historic District (TMP #221.12-2-2.1). Zoned R2; Tax Map Parcel ID #221.12-2-2.1; Applicant: Evan & Jackie Bracy; Plan Preparer: CE Fencing

HISTORIC SITE REVIEW; and

WHEREAS, the site is in the Court St. Historic District and is subject to historic site review per Zoning Code Section 360-32; and

WHEREAS, the historic site review application and associated materials have been reviewed by the City's Public Works, Building Inspector, Environmental Services, Emergency Services and Municipal Lighting Departments who did not have any additional comment; and

WHEREAS, the historic site review application and related materials have been reviewed by the City's Community Development Office which has submitted a staff report dated November 16, 2022 to the Planning Board for the Planning Board's consideration; and

WHEREAS, public hearing for the said project was held on November 28, 2022 in accordance with the City of Plattsburgh's *Zoning Code* Section 360-56; and now, therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the City of Plattsburgh Planning Board does hereby:

- A. Receive and place on file the said Community Development Office's staff report dated November 16, 2022; and
- B. Concur with the said items and recommendations contained in the said Community Development Office's staff report dated November 16, 2022; and be it further

RESOLVED, that unless otherwise extended by the Planning Board this historic site review decision shall expire upon the following occurrences:

- A. The applicant fails to undertake the proposed action or project; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Planning Board does hereby establish the following additional conditions of approval:

- A. Subject to the project complying with all Permit requirements; and
- B. Subject to the applicant complying with any requirements of the Planning Board noted in the Planning Board Resolution discussion; and

RESOLVED, that upon the applicant completing all of the above requirements the City's Community Development Office is hereby authorized to transmit one copy of the executed Historic Site Review Approval notice to the applicant and a copy to the City's Building Inspector informing him that the application and supporting materials are in compliance with the City's Planning Board requirements, including any comments noted within the "Discussion" below;

Seconded By: Abby Meuser-Herr

Discussion & Conditions (Not Verbatim):

The board noted that this property is located on a corner lot, however, the proposed improvements are not within the corner area subject to corner lot restrictions.

The board further noted that the contractor should take caution when digging posts for the fence and coordinate with Dig Safe due to the presence of the sanitary sewer line.

The applicant stated that easements on the property will be accommodated.

The board requested that the contractor terminate the fences on a post and not attach the fence to the building. A small attachment may be necessary but should not impair the character or materials of the building.

The board applied a condition that the applicant must coordinate with the Community Development Office to adhere to any SHPO recommendations that occur within the referral period and further conditioned that the installation of the fences shall not cause damage to the building.

Roll Call:	<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	<u>Absent</u>	<u>Abstain</u>
Jim Abdallah	X			
Rick Perry	X			
Reg Carter			X	
Curt Gervich,			X	
Abby Meuser-Herr	X			
Tom Cosgro (Alt)	X			

Carried: 4-0-0