Statement of Findings City of Plattsburgh Downtown Area Improvement Projects

Clinton County, New York

Location:

City of Plattsburgh

Project Sponsor:

City of Plattsburgh 41 City Hall Place Plattsburgh, NY 12901

Lead Agency:

City of Plattsburgh Common Council 41 City Hall Place Plattsburgh, NY 12901

SEQR Classification:

Type I

Lead Agency Contact:

Matthew Miller
City of Plattsburgh
Director of Community Development
41 City Hall Place
Plattsburgh, NY 12901
(518) 536-7520
millerma@cityofplattsburgh-ny.gov

Final Environmental Impact Statement Filed

January 30, 2020

Statement of Findings Adopted

February 20, 2020

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	0 INTRODUCTION			
	1.1	Project Description	1	
	1.2	Purpose and Need	4	
	1.3	List of Approvals and Permits Required	5	
	1.4	Procedural History	7	
2.0	FIND	NGS CONCERNING ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS	9	
	2.1	Land Use, Community Character, Zoning and Public Policy	9	
	2.2	Aquatic and Natural Resources	14	
	2.3	Municipal Utilities	17	
	2.4	Traffic and Transportation	20	
	2.5	Parking	22	
	2.6	Fiscal and Economic Conditions	25	
	2.7	Historic and Cultural Resources	28	
	2.8	Environmental Contamination	30	
	2.9	Recreation and Open Space	33	
	2.10	Visual Resources	35	
3.0	ALTERNATIVES			
	3.1	"No-Action" Alternative	36	
	3.2	Alternative B: Planned DLMUD with Downtown Parking Garage at Broad Street	38	
	3.3	Alternative C: Reduced Residential Count and Increased Commercial Square Feet	38	
4.0	ADVE	ERSE UNAVOIDABLE IMPACTS	40	
5.0	IRREVERSIBLE IRRETRIEVABLE COMMITMENT OF RESOURCES			
6.0	CUMULATIVE GROWTH INDUCING ASPECTS			
7.0	ENEF	RGY RESOURCES	43	
	7.1	Effects on the Use and Conservation of Energy Resources	43	
8.0	FUTL	JRE SEQR ACTIONS	43	
9.0	CEPT	CERTIFICATION		

Acronyms

ACM Asbestos Containing Material

APE Are of Potential Effect

APMPP Arnie Pavone Memorial Parking Plaza

BID Business Improvement District

BSMPL Broad Street Municipal Parking Lot

BSPI Bridge Street Parking Improvements

CCIDA Clinton County IDA

CRIS Cultural Resource Information System
DAIP Downtown Area Improvement Projects
DLMUD Durkee Lot Mixed-Use Development
DPHD Downtown Plattsburgh Historic District

DPW Department of Public Works

DRI Downtown Revitalization Initiative
DRP Durkee Lot Redevelopment Plan

DRSI Durkee Street Reconfiguration and Streetscape Improvements

DSMPL Durkee Street Municipal Parking Lot
EIS Environmental Impact Statement
FRB Financial Restructuring Board

GEIS Generic Environmental Impact Statement

GML General Municipal Law

ICV Investors Corporation of Vermont

IPAC Information for Planning and Consulting system

ITE Institute of Transportation Engineers

LOS Levels of Service

LPC Local Planning Committee

LWRP Local Waterfront Revitalization Program

MLD Municipal Lighting Department

NYCRR New York Codes, Rules and Regulations

NYS New York State

NYSDEC New York State Department of Environmental Conservation

NYSDOH New York State Department of Health
NYSDOS New York State Department of State

NYSDOT New York State Department of Transportation
NYSEG New York State Electric and Gas Corporation

NYSESD New York State Empire State Development Corporation

NYSOPHRP New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

PCSD Plattsburgh Central School District

PFCM Plattsburgh Farmers' and Crafters' Market

PILOT	Payment in Lieu of Taxes

PPAC Plattsburgh Parking Advisory Committee

PUD Planned Unit Development
RI Remedial Investigation
ROD Record of Decision

SAD Special Assessment District

SEQRA State Environmental Quality Review Act

SHPO State Historic Preservation Office

SIP Strategic Investment Plan
SMP Site Management Plan

SPDES State Pollution Discharge Elimination System

SRTG Saranac River Trail Greenway

SSESC Standards and Specifications for Erosion and Sediment Control

SVOCs Semi-Volatile Organic Compounds
SWPPP Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan

USFWS US Fish and Wildlife Service
UTEP Uniform Tax-Exempt Policy
VOCs Volatile Organic Compounds

WFP Water Filtration Plant

WPI Westelcom Park Improvements
WRRF Water Resource Recovery Facility

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The Downtown Revitalization Initiative (DRI) is an initiative conceived by Governor Cuomo and funded by New York State (NYS) to improve the vitality of urban centers throughout the State. The City of Plattsburgh (the "City") received its DRI award in 2017 during the first round of DRI funding allocations and secured \$10 million in public funding for a series of projects "because strong and sustainable job growth in the region has increased the demand for housing and retail opportunities in the downtown."

The State's DRI process required the City to evaluate a variety of downtown improvements (as identified in the application) and their potential benefit to advancing the City's vision for revitalizing downtown. Upon receiving notice of selection as a DRI Community, the City organized a Local Planning Committee (LPC) comprised of residents, civic leaders, and business owners to lead a planning process and create a unified vision for the role that DRI investment should play in building Plattsburgh's future. The City was assisted by a consultant team selected by NYS. The LPC guided extensive community engagement, including four public events. This process worked to identify priority investments in Downtown that would form the basis for a Strategic Investment Plan (SIP). NYS subsequently reviewed the SIP, selected a series of projects from the SIP for funding which were deemed to best serve the goals of the DRI, and notified the City of its decisions. The City then entered into several separate contracts with multiple NYS agencies to fund the selected projects. Not all projects included in the SIP were selected for DRI funding and several of the projects awarded DRI funding are also anticipated to receive additional funding from other sources.

Under the DRI, Plattsburgh proposes to build on recent public and private investments, including a new municipal marina, streetscape improvements, and the renovation of historic buildings to create a vibrant downtown that that will attract and retain residents, visitors and businesses by creating dynamic neighborhoods where tomorrow's workforce will want to live, work, and raise a family. The focus will be on mixed-use infill development, a greater variety of retail and housing, expansion of the successful Farmers' Market and providing an enhanced connection to the waterfront.

1.1 Project Description

In connection with the DRI, the City of Plattsburgh is undertaking a series of revitalization efforts that are collectively described as the Downtown Area Improvement Projects (DAIP). A total of eight projects are proposed; four of the eight projects were conceptually identified in the City's DRI application and SIP, and the balance are planned by the City to complement this investment.

The DAIP are briefly described as follows; a more comprehensive description is included in the DGEIS: (Note: Projects marked below with an asterisk (*) were included in the DRI).

Durkee Lot Mixed-Use Development (DLMUD)*

A multi-story mixed-use development. A public-private partnership to develop a mixed-use project at the Durkee Street Municipal Parking Lot (DSMPL) was envisioned as a component of the DRI. Prime Plattsburgh, LLC (Prime) was selected as the preferred developer of the Durkee Street Mixed Use Development (DLMUD) and proposes a five-story, approximately 200,000 square foot (SF) mixed-use development including approximately 115 apartments, approximately 10,000 SF of commercial space, a surface parking lot including approximately 50 spaces to be made available for use by the public, and an underground parking garage for tenants only. Additionally, the project proposes the rehabilitation of the existing Plattsburgh Farmers' and Crafters' Market (PFCM) building for use as a commercial space and a publicly-accessible civic space in an open-air pavilion with access from the new pedestrian walkway to be constructed as part of the DLMUD.

The DLMUD would replace the DSMPL. The site encompasses approximately 2.8 acres and is located on a portion of tax parcel 207.20-7-15. A second tax parcel, 207.20-7-14, was recently merged with parcel 207.20-7-15 and the proposed project will occupy a portion of the former footprint of tax parcel 207.20-7-14 as well.

Tax parcel 207.20-7-15 extends across Broad Street and currently contains 289 public parking spaces within the DSMPL, approximately 59 public parking spaces in the Broad Street Municipal Parking Lot (BSMPL, described below), the Gateway Office Building and its associated two-story parking structure, the PFCM building, and a pedestrian walkway along the Saranac River.

The proposed DLMUD will replace the DSMPL and rehabilitate the PFCM building. The Gateway Office Building and its associated two-story parking structure (collectively, the Gateway Complex) will remain. Access to the new development will be primarily from Durkee Street, with underground parking access from Bridge Street.

Previous development of the site was completed under a General Municipal Law (GML) Redevelopment Plan. The Redevelopment Plan provided incentives to the developer at that time in order to achieve the City's goal of eliminating blight. The

Redevelopment Plan and associated tax incentives will be terminated by the Common Council.

The DLMUD will require two Special Use Permits from the City's Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA): 1) to replace existing Planned Unit Development (PUD) with new PUD boundaries and 2) to allow apartments on the first floor of a multistory building within a PUD. The project will also require Planning Board approval for a minor subdivision to subdivide the site from the Broad Street Municipal Parking Lot; for internal subdivision of and replacement of the existing PUD boundaries; and for Site Plan Approval.

Saranac Riverwalk (Riverwalk)*

Complementing the proposed DLMUD, the City is also undertaking the design and construction of a Riverwalk along the Saranac River to replace the existing deteriorated pedestrian walkway. The Riverwalk will be located at the top of the western bank of the Saranac River between Bridge and Broad Streets.

The Riverwalk will contain a walkway with an overlook and landscape plantings that will accommodate pedestrians. It will provide connectivity to MacDonough Park to the north via a crosswalk over Bridge Street, and to the Saranac River Trail and Greenway (SRTG) to the south via a path to be constructed between the Gateway Complex and Broad Street that will connect to the existing sidewalk at the intersection of Broad and Durkee Streets. The approval for internal subdivision of the PUD required from the Planning Board will separate the footprint of the Riverwalk from that of the DLMUD;

Durkee Street Reconfiguration and Streetscape Improvements (DRSI)*

This project involves the reconfiguration of Durkee Street from two-way traffic to one-way, northbound traffic with streetscape improvements (wider sidewalks, street tree plantings, pedestrian lighting, transformer art covers) and the establishment of additional angled and parallel on-street parking on Durkee Street between Broad and Bridge Streets;

Westelcom Park Improvements (WPI)*

The City has proposed improvements to the existing Westelcom Park, transforming the park to meet current needs and improve connectivity to downtown. The park is located across the street from the proposed DLMUD. The redesign will result in an Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) compliant multitiered park that will include sculpture areas, a water feature, a plaza, bicycle infrastructure, and pedestrian walking areas with landscaping throughout. An

existing, aged, 15-inch sewer line will be replaced and relocated within the project site with a new 15-inch sewer line to facilitate the proposed design.

Bridge Street Parking Improvements (BSPI)

Streetscape improvements and new parallel, public, on-street parking spaces along the south side of Bridge Street between Durkee Street and the Veterans' Bridge;

Arnie Pavone Memorial Parking Plaza (APMPP)

The vacant former Glens Falls National Bank building and associated parking area located at 25 Margaret Street will be redeveloped as the APMMP, providing additional public parking spaces. The construction of APMPP will require the demolition of the former bank building and abandonment of an adjacent, little-used City street (Division Street) and the incorporation of that street's footprint into the APMPP.

Broad Street Municipal Parking Lot (BSMPL)

The proposed improvements to the existing BSMPL located to the south of Broad Street between Durkee Street and the Saranac River include expansion and restriping of the existing parking lot;

Plattsburgh Farmers' and Crafters' Market (PFCM) Relocation and Expansion*

The City proposes to relocate the PFCM from its current location at 22 Durkee Street to 26 Green Street within the City's Harborside Area near Green Street and Dock Street. The relocated PFCM will operate in one of the former Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting District (PMLD) buildings, previously known as Building 4. The building is anticipated to be rehabilitated and additional improvements completed to allow for future expansion of the PFCM. Also, the existing paved area, providing access from Green Street, will be reconfigured to provide parking, passive open space, and a pavilion area.

1.2 Purpose and Need

The DAIP are being undertaken to support downtown revitalization in the City. Several of the projects are anticipated to receive funding through the NYS DRI award to advance downtown revitalization. Those projects that are not funded by the DRI will receive funding through alternate sources (New York State Financial Restructuring Board (FRB) and/or the City's General Fund).

According to the DRI SIP, "the population living within Downtown has grown nearly 10% since 2000. By comparison, the City and County experienced 6% and 3% population growth respectively during that same period. Moreover, major investments within the region by key industrial employers — including Norsk Titanium, Bombardier Transportation, and the Plattsburgh International Airport — are working to add jobs and improve opportunities for future residents, workers, and visitors." The overall DRI project is expected to bring in 500 temporary jobs, 100 permanent jobs, about \$11 million in downtown revenue, and result in a considerable increase in tax revenue, putting the City in a more fiscally sound position.

The DAIP are expected to bring in temporary and permanent jobs, downtown revenue, and improve the City's fiscal status. As a result of these projects, parking resources will be spread out more evenly throughout the downtown and will allow easier access for a variety of users. The City's public-private partnership with Prime to develop the DLMUD will spur economic development on the underutilized property and is consistent with objectives outlined in various public policies of the City. By replacing a parking lot with mixed-use development, the DLMUD will increase visibility and economic activity in this area of the downtown and bring attention to other riverfront resources like the Saranac River Trail Greenway (SRTG).

1.3 List of Approvals and Permits Required

Table 1: Required Approvals and Permits

Agency	Project	Approval/Permit
1. City of Plattsburgh	All Projects	SEQRA Determination
Common Council		
	DLMUD, WPI,	Termination of the pre-existing
	BSMPL	GML Redevelopment Plan for the
		Downtown Area and its related tax
		incentive
	DLMUD	Disposition of City-owned property
		and related easements
		Developer's Agreement
	APMPP	Abandonment of Division Street
		(§295)
2. City of Plattsburgh DLMUD, BSMPL		Minor Subdivision (§300)
Planning Board		

Agency	Project	Approval/Permit
	DLMUD	 Site Plan Approval (§360, Article VI) PUD Approval (§360-21) and Subdivision
,	Riverwalk; DRSI; BSPI; APMPP; WPI; BSMPL; PFCM Relocation to Building 4 at 26 Green Street	Coordination for all Projects listed
3. City of Plattsburgh Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA)	DLMUD	Special Use Permit (§360-31)¹: 1) Special Use Permit for placement of new PUD boundaries; 2) Special Use Permit for Apartments on the first floor of a multistory building within a Planned Unit Development
4. Clinton County Planning Board	DLMUD; Riverwalk ² ; BSMPL ²	GML Referral (§12B-239)
5. Clinton County Industrial Development Agency (CCIDA)	DLMUD	Payment in Lieu of Taxes (PILOT) approval
6. City of Plattsburgh Department of Public Works (DPW)	DLMUD; Riverwalk; DRSI; BSPI	 Highway Work Permit for Non- Utility Work Highway Work Permit for Utility Work
7. New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC)	DLMUD	 State Pollution Discharge Elimination System (SPDES) General Permit GP-0-20-001³ for Stormwater Discharges from Construction Activities Article 15 Permit
8. New York State Office of Community Renewal (NYSOCR)	PFCM Relocation to Building 4 at 26 Green Street	Notice to Proceed with work

Agency	Project	Approval/Permit
9. New York State	All Projects	Consultation pursuant to Section
Office of Parks,	~1	14.09
Recreation and		,
Historic Preservation		
(NYSOPRHP)		

¹ Both Special Use Permit requests by the City will be included in a single application to the ZBA but will constitute two separate approvals. ² The Riverwalk and BSMPL are included here only insofar as their proposed footprints occupy lands involved in the subdivision actions related to the DLMUD. Individual approval of these projects by the Clinton County Planning Board is not required. ³ The New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC) has issued the State Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (SPDES) General Permit for Stormwater Discharges from Construction Activity (GP-0-20-001). Upon its effective date of January 29, 2020, GP-0-20-001 replaces the previous general permit, GP-0-15-002, which expired on January 28, 2020.

1.4 Procedural History

The Common Council recognized that the DAIP may result in one or more significant impacts on the environment and wished to review the potential impacts of the DAIP taken together rather than separately. The Common Council determined to conduct this comprehensive review of the DAIP through preparation of a Generic Environmental Impact Statement (GEIS) pursuant to SEQRA and Section 617.10 of the implementing Regulations set forth at Title 6 of the New York Compilation of Codes, Rules and Regulations (NYCRR). According to the SEQRA Handbook, "A generic EIS differs from a site or project specific EIS by being more general or conceptual in nature. The broader focus of a generic EIS may aid the lead agency in identifying and broadly analyzing the cumulative impacts of a group of actions, or a combination of impacts from a single action. Generic EISs may identify information gaps to be assessed on a site- or project-specific basis or may address some issues through hypothetical scenarios." The level of detail in a GEIS is usually provided at a conceptual level and presented in broader scale/prospective than a site-specific EIS. A GEIS is the appropriate tool for review of potential impacts of the DAIP as it allows for the evaluation of a number of impacts associated with these related projects focusing on the consequences these impacts may have on Plattsburgh's built and natural environment.

The following is a summary of the procedural history of the Common Council's SEQRA review of the DAIP, including the documentation and information relied upon by the Common Council:

- The City of Plattsburgh Common Council was designated as Lead Agency for SEQRA review of the DAIP on June 6, 2019.
- A public scoping session was held on August 22, 2019 at which time the public was given the opportunity to comment on the Draft Scoping Document which outlined the proposed contents of the Draft Generic Environmental Impact Statement (DGEIS). A Final Scoping Document was adopted by the Common Council on September 5, 2019. The DGEIS and associated plans, reports, and studies were prepared based on the Final Scoping Document.
- The Common Council declared the DGEIS complete for public review and circulation on November 21, 2019. The DGEIS and Notice of Completion were duly circulated as required by SEQRA. The DGEIS was also posted on the City's website. A Notice of Acceptance of Draft GEIS and Public Hearing was published in the Environmental Notice Bulletin (ENB) on December 4, 2020.
- A public hearing allowing for public comment on the DGEIS was held by the Common Council on December 9, 2019. The public comment period remained open through December 23, 2019. Copies of the transcript from the public hearing and the written comments received on the DGEIS are provided in the Final Generic Environmental Impact Statement (FGEIS).
- The Common Council accepted the FGEIS as complete on January 30, 2020. In accordance with Section 617.9(b)(7) of the SEQRA regulations, the FGEIS incorporated by reference the DGEIS dated November 21, 2019, and all supporting appendices. The FGEIS and Notice of Completion were duly circulated as required by SEQRA and a Notice of Acceptance of the FGEIS was published in the Environmental Notice Bulletin (ENB) on February 12, 2020.

The DGEIS and FGEIS are available on the City's website at https://www.cityofplattsburgh-ny.gov/604/DRI-Environmental-Impact-GEIS.

Pursuant to Article 8 of the New York State Environmental Conservation Law (the State Environmental Quality Review Act) and 6 NYCRR Part 617, the City of Plattsburgh Common Council, as Lead Agency, makes the following findings:

2.0 FINDINGS CONCERNING ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS

2.1 Land Use, Community Character, Zoning and Public Policy

The DAIP are located within the City's Downtown Area and in the Harborside Area, which is comprised of an urban environment that includes a diverse mix of land uses (commercial, municipal, institutional, civic and religious uses with some mixed-use residential and commercial buildings), with the Saranac River as the dividing feature between the two Areas.

The eight DAIP sites are located within or near to the National and State Register of Historic Places Eligible Downtown Plattsburgh Historic District (DPHD), which the NYS Office of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation (NYSOPRHP) finds to be "architecturally and historically significant as a largely intact City business core, reflecting the growth and development of Plattsburgh as a regional commercial hub and industrial center from the early nineteenth to the mid-twentieth century."

All of the DAIP are located within the Central Business (C) Zoning District, with the exception of the proposed relocated PFCM, which will be located within the Industrial Zoning District.

The DLMUD, Riverwalk, the BSMPL, and portions of both the DRSI and BSPI project sites are currently subject to a Special Use Permit approved January 20, 2004 and a PUD² approved on February 28, 2005 (as amended). As such, these sites (with the exception of the DRSI and BSPI sites which are located within City Streets) are subject to the requirements of the approved Special Use Permit and the approved PUD, which supersede the underlying zoning regulations.

To facilitate redevelopment and construction of the proposed DLMUD, two Special Use Permits are required from the City's ZBA, including 1) placement of new PUD boundaries; and 2) to allow apartments on the first floor of a multistory building within a PUD. The project will also require Planning Board approval for a minor subdivision to subdivide the

¹ New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (NYSOPRHP). *Downtown Plattsburgh Historic District Resource Evaluation*. Page 2. April 19, 2016.

² Per §360-21, a Planned Unit Development, (PUD) is defined as, "a subdivision plat or plats, approved pursuant to City Code Chapter 300, Subdivision of Land, in which the minimum lot size requirements, minimum yard requirements, and minimum open space requirements as specified in Schedule II, Schedule of Area and Bulk Controls, of this chapter of the City Code, and in which the maximum number of structures and dwelling units on a lot as specified in §360-18 of this chapter of the City Code, and any amendments thereto, may be varied to provide an alternative permitted method for the layout, configuration and design of lots, buildings and structures, roads, utility lines and other infrastructure, parks and landscaping in order to preserve the natural and scenic qualities of open lands."

site from the BSMPL; for internal subdivision of and placement of new PUD boundaries; and for Site Plan Approval.

The Special Use Permit related to the PUD boundaries will be undertaken to approve the new boundaries of the previously approved 5.3-acre PUD to remove the BSMPL project site, and to add the area formerly occupied by Highway Oil (formerly known as tax parcel 207.20-7-14). The uses permitted within the PUD will be augmented to include additional uses currently allowed within the underlying C Zoning District. The PUD would continue to include the existing four-story Gateway Office Building and its parking garage.

The DLMUD will include a single, U-shaped mixed-use residential and commercial building oriented towards the River and located on the northern part of the project site. The existing PFCM building will also be rehabilitated as part of the proposed project. A pedestrian pathway will separate the proposed building from the proposed surface parking lot with landscaping located on both sides. The pedestrian pathway will connect with the proposed improved Riverwalk and the proposed improved Westelcom Park. The buildings are proposed to feature a mix of materials, including stone, cement board and plank, frieze and cornice detailing with contrasting metal detailing to mark fenestration and other fine details. Commercial uses are anticipated to include restaurant and retail uses but may include other commercial uses permitted in the C Zoning District. Landscaping will be provided around the perimeter of the building and within the parking areas.

The City of Plattsburgh Zoning Ordinance allows for the creation of PUDs in §360-21. The purpose of a PUD is to enable and encourage flexibility in the design of a project so as to preserve the natural and scenic qualities of open lands. The existing Gateway Complex on the proposed Lot 2A within the PUD was previously approved by the Planning Board.

The proposed DLMUD on the proposed Lot 2B within the PUD has been designed to revitalize an underutilized parcel in the downtown with a mixed-use development. It will help redefine the streetscape with a building edge along Durkee and Bridge Streets and is designed to fit into the existing fabric of the downtown and provide an open space pedestrian corridor connection from the proposed improved Westelcom Park to the Saranac River riverfront walkway. The site design for the DLMUD is focused on balancing the mixed-use development with parking needs and open space connections within the PUD.

The DLMUD will require some deviations from the underlying C Zoning District requirements, which act as guidelines for the design of a PUD. The Planning Board is authorized to vary these guidelines in pursuit of a desirable project. The deviations affect bulk (setbacks, height, and maximum lot dimension) and parking and site access

guidelines and reflect the unique circumstances of the project site, which is partially developed and borders public land on the waterfront. For these reasons, the bulk deviations are justified. The parking deviation is justified because the DLMUD is being undertaken in unison with the other DAIP, which include parking projects that will ameliorate any perceived loss of parking on the DLMUD site.

The DLMUD, as currently proposed, has been shaped by an extensive public engagement process conducted throughout 2019, which has resulted in a scaling down of the project size. The initial project proposal included two multi-story buildings encompassing approximately 127 market rate residential units with 13,515 square feet of commercial / retail space. Changes to the development included adjustment to building placement to improve pedestrian access and, at the City's request, to provide adequate space for on-street parking along Durkee Street, allowing for additional space for the Riverwalk project. Initially, revisions increased the number of residential units to 139, reduced the commercial / retail space to 13,000 SF and implemented underground parking in both buildings to include 286 on-site parking spaces. On site green space was increased and the residential amenities were relocated. Further, the City and the PFCM worked cooperatively to agree to the proposed relocation plan for the PFCM.

Further revisions to the site design were accomplished with additional public input resulting in the current project configuration which includes approximately 115 residential units, approximately 10,000 SF of commercial / retail space contained in one, U-shaped building, and 3,400 SF of commercial space to be located in the current PFCM building. The site design revisions provided a full access-controlled parking garage that allows for parking spaces below the building and street level parking spaces. The removal of the second building allows for an additional open-surface lot parking. The revised site plan improves the visual connectivity from Westelcom Park to the proposed Riverwalk area while also allowing for an additional 2,400 square feet of public civic space adjacent to the proposed Riverwalk to be housed under the pavilion of the current PFCM building.

The DLMUD building has been designed with a mix of architectural design elements sympathetic to other downtown architectural precedents that also offers a blend of old and new, including:

- brick and stone masonry; metal panel; board and batten siding; clapboard siding;
- punched openings;
- stone sill and lintel aesthetic;
- · opening proportions similar in scale;
- larger ground level glazing for commercial uses; and

strong cornice expression.

The utilization of these recognized architectural principles ensures that the project is compatible with the downtown area of the City and the surrounding buildings while at the same time revitalizing this area of the City with modern development to facilitate a walkable downtown core.

The remaining DAIP are City-owned project sites (Riverwalk, DRSI, BSPI, APMPP, WPI, BSMPL, and Building 4 at 26 Green Street) and will undergo future coordination with applicable City Boards and Commissions to ensure consistency with applicable public policy. The proposed projects will result in permitted uses that that will beneficially affect the land use character of the project area.

- The proposed ADA-compliant multi-use path Riverwalk will connect via a crosswalk over Bridge Street to MacDonough Park to the north and the soon to be constructed Phase II portion of the SRTG to the south at Broad and Durkee Streets. The Riverwalk would be accessible from areas west of Durkee Street via the pedestrian corridor provided on the DLMUD. The improved Riverwalk will be entirely contained within the City-owned Lot 2A of the proposed amended PUD. The City will seek internal PUD subdivision approval from the Planning Board to separate this lot and will maintain ownership of the riverfront lot.
- The DRSI will occur primarily within City rights-of-way and would alter the current two-way traffic pattern to a one-way, northbound only, traffic pattern, and would provide improved traffic conditions, standard-width sidewalks, lighting, and landscaping. On-street parking would be reconfigured to align with the new oneway street and would include angled and parallel parking spaces.
- The BSPI will occur primarily within City rights-of-way and would introduce new parallel parking spaces on the south side of Bridge Street and improved sidewalks, lighting, and landscaping.
- The proposed APMPP would provide additional public parking at a convenient location serving nearby neighborhood uses.
- The WPI project would result in an ADA-compliant multi-tiered park, which will include sculpture areas, a water feature, a plaza, bicycle infrastructure, and pedestrian walking areas with landscaping throughout.
- The BSMPL improvements would provide for additional parking spaces.

• The City-owned building proposed for the relocated PFCM (Building 4 at 26 Green Street) is anticipated to be rehabilitated, including exterior façade improvement (e.g. painting), interior remodeling (e.g. painting, lighting, removal of walls), improved ventilation, reconfiguring of existing fencing, electrical upgrades, the addition of a new pavilion space, and additional restrooms. The existing paved area providing access from Green Street to the project site will be reconfigured to provide parking and passive open space, including a pavilion area.

Revitalization of the Downtown and Harborside Areas have been the focus of the City's public policy for some time.

- The 1999 Comprehensive Plan called out the need for 'intense development' for revitalization of the Downtown Area.
- The 2016 Local Waterfront Revitalization Plan (LWRP) places a strong emphasis
 on economic development and downtown revitalization. Durkee Street and the
 surrounding downtown sub-area is sited as "a gateway to the downtown and a
 focal area in linking the downtown to the waterfront at Dock Street". The area is
 recognized by the LWRP as a prime location for mixed-use development, parking,
 and river access.
- In 2010 the City of Plattsburgh produced a Brownfield Opportunity Area (BOA) Pre-Nomination Study (the "BOA study") in response to an economic revival following the redevelopment and repurposing of the Plattsburgh Air Force Base, which included the DSMPL as Site 22 amongst other sites that could be redeveloped to create visual and physical connections between the Downtown and the waterfront and could serve as housing opportunities available near the Downtown where brownfield sites could be re-used or developed.
- The 2009 Streetscape and Design Guidelines provide insight on local Downtown Area architectural context and provide a reference point for design practices that may be considered consistent with area architecture.
- In 2003, the Plattsburgh Downtown/Waterfront Economic Enhancement Strategy was developed to guide and spur redevelopment in Downtown through the establishment of zones and districts, including Arts and Entertainment, Government, and Waterfront. The Arts and Entertainment District (containing many of the DAIP) Economic Enhancement Strategy placed specific emphasis on Bridge Street, from Margaret Street to the Saranac River; and Durkee Street, from Bridge Street to Broad Street and recommended a diverse set of retail, office and

residential uses to complement and enhance the downtown, with infill development of the DSMPL.

The Economic Enhancement Strategy for the Lakefront District, within which the PFCM would be relocated, states that all development in the Lakefront District should place an emphasis on the creation of an attractive and vibrant waterfront community. The Plan recommends prepared food uses, marine-oriented entertainment, convenience retail, and housing and other uses.

The DAIP will center a mixed-use residential development (DLMUD) at the Saranac River waterfront connecting it with the WPI and nearby cultural resources, the SRTG, and the parks located north of Bridge Street with the component projects (Riverwalk, DRSI, BPSI, APMPP, and BSMPL) playing a supporting role in the revitalization efforts that will ensure that the composite needs of a good downtown (parking, pedestrian infrastructure, streetscaping, and passive recreation opportunities) are met. The relocation of PFCM to the Harborside Area will further assist in revitalization of the waterfront as it will bring people to the shore of Cumberland Bay.³

The proposed DAIP will work in unison to capitalize on the City's existing assets in this area by connecting them through improved streets and parking conditions, waterfront and inter-block connections, bringing people to the area through housing and commercial uses and redeveloping an underutilized waterfront parcel, with considerable environmental issues, into use with a contextual-designed mixed-use development. Accordingly, the proposed projects are consistent with the City's public policy and will implement several recommendations and goals that pertain to this area of the City.

Based on the foregoing and the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on land use, community character, zoning and public policy and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.2 Aquatic and Natural Resources

The DAIP sites are developed sites in an urban environment featuring, buildings, pavement, and lawn/landscaping. There are no mapped NYSDEC regulated wetlands or adjacent areas or significant natural communities on or adjacent to the project sites, with the exception of Building 4 at 26 Green Street, proposed for the relocated PFCM.

³ The City is actively pursuing master planning efforts for the Harborside Area, which will work to integrate the Downtown and Harborside Areas to create a vibrant urban landscape at the gateway to Cumberland Bay.

The Saranac River is a NYSDEC-regulated Class C stream (Regulation 830-54.1), which has a standard identification of C(TS) for waters supporting fisheries and suitable for non-contact activities and with the ability to support trout spawning. The US Fish and Wildlife Services (USFWS) National Wetland Inventory (NWI) mapper also identifies the Saranac River as a riverine (R2UBH) resource.

The Saranac River is identified as a regulatory floodway by the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA). Riverbank areas adjoining the Saranac are identified as being within the 100- and 500-year floodplains or having a one percent or 0.2 percent annual flood risk, respectively. The planned Riverwalk is located at an elevation of approximately 115 – 119 feet above the base flood elevation (or 100-year flood level) established at 105 – 108 feet.

The PFCM is proposed to be relocated to Building 4 at 26 Green Street in the Harborside Area of the City, which occupies a portion of a tax parcel that abuts the Cumberland Bay area of Lake Champlain. The Cumberland Bay in this area is a NYSDEC regulated lake (Regulation 830-3, Class and Standard B). Class B indicates that the lake is best used for swimming and other contact recreation, but not for drinking water. The area of the project site abutting the mapped lake area is developed with lawn and/or graveled area.

The DLMUD will be designed in conformance with the NYSDEC's Stormwater Management Design Manual and Standards and Specifications for Erosion and Sediment Control. As such, it will contain water quality and erosion control measures and will obtain a State Pollution Discharge Elimination System (SPDES) Permit. In order to obtain this permit the project will develop a full Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) which will include measures to mitigate pollution both during construction and throughout the life of the project with a maintenance program for all water quality features. For the remaining sites, construction-phase stormwater pollution control is required, which will include implementing temporary and permanent erosion and sediment control measures.

Currently the DSMPL discharges stormwater to the Saranac River via a stormwater culvert without any outlet protection. As a result, the stream bank is severely eroded. As part of the DLMUD project, one stormwater outlet will be installed within the bank of the Saranac River. The River is regulated by the NYSDEC under Article 15 and a permit is required for regulated activities that disturb the bed or banks of the River. Therefore, an Article 15 permit from the NYSDEC will be required for the DLMUD.

The DLMUD includes an underground parking area and the depth for construction is anticipated to require excavation to a depth up to approximately 15 feet. Preparation of the site for project development will require clearing, grubbing, grading, ripping, hoe ramming, and proof-rolling any lightly disturbed natural soils left in-place following

completion of excavation activities. Blasting is not anticipated at this time. If blasting is required, it will be performed in accordance with New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) Geotechnical Engineering Manual #22 "Procedures for Blasting" latest edition. A Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) will be prepared for the development to ensure compliance with the NYSDEC General Permit for Stormwater Discharges from Construction Activity GP GP-0-20-001.

Soil disturbance is anticipated to be limited to a maximum depth of 16 inches for paving projects. The demolition of the former bank building on the APMPP site will require removal of foundations to approximately three feet below grade. Approximately 7 - 10 feet of excavation will be required for the utility work associated with the WPI project. These projects are not anticipated to encounter groundwater or bedrock in this urban area. The existing paved area providing access from Green Street to the PFCM project site will be reconfigured to provide parking and other amenities. Erosion and sediment control plans will be developed for each site to ensure erosion does not run off these sites during construction.

The NYSDEC reports there are no known occurrences of endangered, threatened, or rare species or a Significant Natural Community on or in the vicinity of any of the project sites. The NYSDEC indicates that there are known occurrences of the Common Loon, a Species of Special Concern, on or in the vicinity of the DLMUD project site, the Riverwalk project site, and the relocation site for the PFCM (Building 4 at 26 Green Street). Species of Special Concern (as defined in Section 182.2(i) of 6NYCRR Part 182) warrant attention and consideration but current information, collected by NYSDEC, does not justify listing these species as either endangered or threatened. NYS does not regulate species that are not listed as endangered or threatened.

In an October 10, 2019 letter, the NYSDEC stated that the "Common Loon is documented in Lake Champlain at Plattsburgh, and so could occur in the vicinity of the proposed farmer's market relocation project site." The proposed projects do not require in-water work or disturbance to the bed or banks of Lake Champlain. The relocation of the PFCM to the Building 4 at 26 Green Street will not result in a direct increase in in-water recreational activities and is located far from the water's edge.

According to the USFWS online consultation through the Information for Planning and Consultation system (IPAC), there is potential for the Northern Long-eared Bat (threatened) on or in the vicinity of each of the project sites. It is recommended that no tree clearing occur between March 31st and October 31st to avoid potential take of the Northern Long-eared Bat. If tree clearing is proposed to occur during this time period and

involves clearing of trees with a diameter at breast height (dbh) of three inches or more, then coordination with the USFWS is recommended.

Installation of a stormwater outlet within the bank of the Saranac River in compliance with an Article 15 permit from the NYSDEC will be an improvement over the current uncontrolled discharge to the River via a stormwater culvert without any outlet protection. The development of a SWPPP and compliance with the SPDES Permit will further ensure that the discharge to the River will both protect water quality and prevent erosion. As there are no stormwater facilities, runoff quality controls, or runoff quantity controls located on any of the project sites, the proposed projects will improve the stormwater conditions flowing from the sites to the Saranac River.

As the proposed projects do not require in-water work or disturbance to the bed or banks of Lake Champlain and relocation of the PFCM to the Building 4 at 26 Green Street will not result in a direct increase in in-water recreational activities and is located far from the water's edge, impacts on the Lake itself or disturbance of possible Common Loon species is not anticipated. Restrictions on tree clearing and coordination with the USFWS will avoid impacts to Northern Long-eared Bats and their habitat.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on aquatic and natural resources and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.3 Municipal Utilities

2.3.1 Stormwater Management

The project area is partially served by a municipal stormwater collection system. There is a closed drainage network of storm drain piping and catch basins located within Durkee, Bridge, and Margaret Streets to receive stormwater runoff. Stormwater collected on Durkee and Margaret Streets is conveyed to the City's Water Resource Recovery Facility (WRRF) via a combined sanitary/storm sewer line. Stormwater collected at the Durkee Street and Bridge Street intersection is conveyed to the area north of Broad Street where it is discharged to the Saranac River. Stormwater collected between Durkee Street and the Saranac River on Bridge Street is discharged to the Saranac River.

The DAIP project sites are vacant, undeveloped, or development of the sites occurred prior to the establishment of stormwater management regulations; stormwater management facilities are generally absent and stormwater treatment practices to

address runoff quantity (e.g. detention basin or underground storage), or runoff quality controls (e.g. bioretention areas) are not located on any of the project sites.

At the DLMUD site, stormwater runoff flows directly into the Saranac River via a drainage pipe and sheet flow. At the Riverwalk and BSMPL sites, the surface drainage sheet flows from west to east and outlets to the top of bank of the Saranac River. At the APMPP site, the existing building appears to have roof drains extending underground, which are presumed to directly discharge into the storm drain piping, or potentially the municipal sanitary sewer system. The storm sewer infrastructure on Margaret Street appears to receive surface runoff from the majority of Division Street and the remaining commercial site. Surface runoff from the westerly portion of the APMPP appears to discharge to catch basins connected to the sanitary sewer system, or combined sewer system. There are no stormwater facilities on the WPI site; similar to the Riverwalk and BSMPL sites, the surface drainage sheet flows from west to east and outlets to the catch basins within Durkee Street or to the top of bank of the Saranac River.

At the DLMUD site, the existing drainage area is comprised of approximately 2.76 acres. The existing impervious (or paved) area is approximately 2.58 acres (93.5% of the site), and the existing pervious area is approximately 0.18 acres. Upon completion, the project site will consist of a 2.8-acre drainage area with 2.42 acres (87.7%) of impervious cover and approximately 0.39 acres of pervious cover; a net increase in permeable area.

The proposed DLMUD project will result in ground disturbance in excess of one acre. Therefore, a SWPPP is required to be prepared in accordance with the NYSDEC General Permit GP-0-20-001. The project is anticipated to be considered a Redevelopment Activity under the SPDES permitting process and a Notice of Intent will be submitted to NYSDEC once Site Plan approval is granted.

With the exception of the DLMUD, the DAIP project sites (and area of planned disturbance) are less than one acre in size and will require less than one acre of ground disturbance. Therefore, no SWPPP is required; however, construction-phase stormwater pollution control is required for these sites in accordance with New York State SSESC, dated November 2016. The APMPP is anticipated to utilize catch basins to tie into the existing storm sewer along Division Street (which will be incorporated into the parking lot) and Margaret Street.

As discussed in Section 2.2, as there are no stormwater facilities, runoff quality controls, or runoff quantity controls located on any of the project sites, the proposed DAIP will improve the stormwater conditions flowing from the sites to the Saranac River.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on stormwater management and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.3.2 Water Supply and Sanitary Sewer

All the project sites are located within the City of Plattsburgh Water and Sewer service areas, which are maintained by the Department of Public Works (DPW).

The DLMUD is expected to generate 29,355 gallons per day (gpd) of domestic water demand and corresponding sanitary flow. The DLMUD will connect to the existing municipal water line and the existing municipal sewer manhole located just west of the site in Durkee Street. An additional sewer line will be constructed to provide an overflow line for the siphon manhole located on the east side of the project site. This overflow line will be connected to a separate connection system's existing manhole in Bridge Street.

The WPI includes a water feature, which will create modest water demand and result in wastewater generation. This site will be served by the City's water and sewer infrastructure. An existing, aged, 15-inch sewer line which traverses the site will be replaced and relocated within the project site with a new 15-inch sewer line to facilitate the proposed design.

Proposed improvements to Building 4 at 26 Green Street for the PFCM relocation may include bathroom upgrades, which will create water demand and result in wastewater generation that will be served by the City's water and sewer infrastructure.

The City's Department of Public Works has confirmed the City has adequate water and sewer capacity to serve the DLMUD, WPI, and PFCM projects. The remaining projects (Riverwalk, DRSI, BSPI, APMPP, and BSMPL) will not require water or sewer infrastructure. Accordingly, no adverse impact to water supply or sanitary sewer from the DAIP is anticipated.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on water supply and sanitary sewer and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. Therefore, no mitigation is required.

2.3.3 Solid Waste

Solid waste generated in the City of Plattsburgh is accepted by the Clinton County Landfill (the "Landfill") located on Sand Road in the Town of Schuyler Falls.

With the exception of the DLMUD, the DAIP sites will remain in City ownership. These sites will be developed as parking lots, improved park and riverfront areas, and improved streetscapes and a farmers' market and solid waste will be accommodated on these sites through the provision of trash receptacles or other solid waste management practices. Solid waste generated at these sites will be carted by the DPW to the Landfill.

The proposed DLMUD is anticipated to generate $3.1 \pm tons$ of solid waste per day, or $95.5 \pm tons$ per month. The waste generated is assumed to be typical municipal solid waste, as well as recyclable materials. The DLMUD will contract with a licensed hauler who will likely transport the waste/recyclables to the Landfill. Construction and demolition waste will be sorted so that materials can be salvaged as desired. Materials that are not salvageable will be transported off-site to the Landfill.

The Clinton County Landfill is anticipated to have adequate capacity to accommodate solid waste generated from the DAIP and the County is currently pursuing a modification to the current Part 360 landfill permit to allow for increased capacity. Accordingly, no adverse impact on solid waste disposal is anticipated from the DAIP.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on solid waste and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.4 Traffic and Transportation

The DAIP projects include improvements to parking, streetscapes and traffic configuration, riverfront and open space resources, and redevelopment projects. A November 2019 Traffic Impact Study (TIS) was completed to understand the impacts the DAIP projects may have on the City's traffic operations.

Seven intersections surrounding the project area were analyzed. These seven intersections are identified as follows:

- Margaret Street and Bridge Street
- Margaret Street and Brinkerhoff Street
- Margaret Street and Broad Street/Pine Street
- Durkee Street and Bridge Street
- Durkee Street and Broad Street
- Peru Street and Bridge Street/Green Street
- Peru Street and Broad Street/Hamilton Street

Traffic volumes at the existing seven locations were documented with turning movement counts during three weekday peak periods: AM, Midday, and PM⁴. The TIS considered other projects in the area that may affect traffic flows; obtained historical traffic volume data for area roadways from the NYSDOT website, and applied a representative growth rate (0.5%) to the existing conditions to establish horizon year (2022) conditions to determine "No-Build" conditions; conducted a trip generation analysis for the proposed projects; assigned the project generated trips to the roadway system; added the project generated trips to the "No-Build" conditions to establish the "Build" condition traffic volumes using a build year of 2022; conducted intersection capacity analyses for the "Existing", "No-Build," and "Build" conditions during the weekday AM, Midday, and PM peak hours to evaluate existing and future operating conditions; and reviewed the available accident data for the most recent three years at the study intersections. The traffic analyses also examined Durkee Street remaining as two-way, and Durkee Street reconfigured into one-way travel in the northbound direction.

The TIS concluded that the proposed DAIP will not have a significant adverse impact on traffic operating conditions on the roadway system. The TIS revealed that the proposed conversion of Durkee Street from two-way to one-way would result in five instances of minor (less than five second) level-of-service (LOS)⁵ delays requiring no mitigation. The reconfiguration will result in three instances of LOS improvements, including improvement at the southbound approach of Durkee Street at Bridge Street during the AM peak hour.

As part of the APMPP project, Division Street will be abandoned in compliance with City Code Chapter 295, Article V, Streets and Sidewalks: Abandonments of Streets, Alleys and Rights-of-Way. The completed APMPP will feature an exit from the Community Bank lot into the APMPP to allow for continued egress from the Community Bank lot to either Margaret Street or Oak Street. During construction of the APMPP, a mode of egress from the Community Bank lot to either Margaret Street or Oak Street will be maintained.

The CCPT Express Shuttle and Uptown Downtown routes have flag stops on Durkee Street. CCPT is aware of the proposed DRSI project, including converting Durkee Street to one-way northbound travel, and is anticipated to modify the route to accommodate affected users.

⁴ A review of the traffic data revealed the peak hours of traffic activity in the project area to generally be: AM Peak Hour: 7:30 AM to 8:30 AM; Midday Peak Hour: 12:15 PM to 1:15 PM; and PM Peak Hour: 3:45 PM to 4:45 PM

⁵ Levels of Service (LOS) range from "A" through "F," with LOS "A" representing the least delays and LOS "F" representing longer delays or capacity deficient operations.

The DAIP will improve pedestrian facilities through improved connectivity, improved crossings, and additional ADA/all access crossings. The new traffic patterns will reduce potential pedestrian/vehicle conflicts and enhance on-street bikeability in the downtown.

A shared-use path to be located along the new Riverwalk will allow cyclists to travel between the Gateway Complex and Broad Street and then along the Saranac River to where it meets Bridge Street. The Riverwalk will connect Phase II of the SRTG to a future Phase III of the Saranac River Trail (SRT). New bike racks are proposed as part of the DLMUD, the Riverwalk, and the WPI and appropriate signage will be installed where new bike infrastructure is implemented.

Although the DAIP will result in a few instances of LOS delays, these delays do not require mitigation and the LOS improvements, improvement of pedestrian and bicycle accessibility and enhancement of access to recreational facilities will advance the City's efforts to revitalize the Downtown and Harborside areas.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on traffic and transportation and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.5 Parking

The City currently provides off-street parking within the Downtown Area on surface lots located on Broad Street (the BSMPL) and Durkee Street (the DSMPL) and two lots on Court Street (Court Street Lot and City Hall Place Lot).

The DLMUD will displace the existing 289-space DSMPL. Four existing off-street parking spaces at Westelcom Park will be eliminated as part of the WPI. The construction of the APMPP will result in the loss of five spaces on the west side of Margaret Street between Brinkerhoff and Division Streets.

Per the City's current zoning requirements, the DLMUD requires 317 parking spaces. However, the City's off-street parking requirements have not been amended in some time. This was recognized in the DGEIS and FGEIS. Realizing that the City's off-street parking requirements have not been amended in some time, and that they do not currently reflect parking requirements in an urban setting, the City has the ability within the PUD regulations to deviate from the Zoning Code's parking requirements. Per City Code § 360-21, the Common Council finds that the Planning Board is authorized to allow deviations from parking requirements established in § 360-26 for a PUD where the

applicant can demonstrate that another method of computation will adequately serve the proposed mixed or multiple use.

We find that such parking deviations may be based on support that examines a totality of the circumstance to ensure that the appropriate amount of off-street parking is provided in accordance with these findings. The Common Council finds that an abundance of vacant parking areas within an urban setting can disrupt achieving a walkable community and commercial development in a downtown core. Furthermore, vacant parking areas are an eyesore that can obstruct commercial tenants from bringing their business to a downtown area.

A parking study of the Downtown Area was conducted by Carl Walker in 2017 (the "Parking Study"), which included an inventory and assessment of current parking conditions and an evaluation of current parking demand and patron service levels. As a component of the parking study, an evaluation of the potential impacts of displacing public parking as a result of any redevelopment of the DSMPL was conducted, and several parking management options were developed for the City to consider. These options include, but are not limited to, eliminating the Special Assessment District (SAD) for parking in favor of parking fees; meeting parking demand on site for any redevelopment of the DSMPL with the provision of additional parking available for use by the public; adding parking capacity in other areas of downtown to balance parking supply geographically; and implementing parking enforcement/management.

As noted above, in the event that an alternate parking plan is sought for the DLMUD project it should be based on data that supports parking occupancy levels to lessen vehicle dependency in the City's downtown area and promote a walkable downtown core, which is the objective of this revitalization project. Thus, depending on the proposed uses in such a mixed-use development, among other factors that may be considered, support shall be provided for each development project to demonstrate that the proposed alternate parking computation would be in accordance with these Findings (e.g. reliance on the Parking Study, the industry's generally accepted parking standards (ITE Standards), similar development examples, etc.). Regardless of how such an alternate method parking computation is demonstrated, the proposed offstreet parking shall avoid an abundance of vacant parking areas, which can disrupt the purpose of this downtown revitalization which is to achieve a more walkable community and commercial development in Plattsburgh's downtown core.

Notwithstanding, as part of the DLMUD, 50 parking spaces in the surface lot will be made available for use by the public. This will ensure that the members of the public will be able to park in this core downtown area and will result in increased visitation to this

revitalized downtown, in accordance with the purpose of this revitalization effort. The DRSI project will create additional on-street parking on Durkee Street. The BSPI project, the APMPP and the BSMPL will all result in additional public parking capacity.

The Plattsburgh Parking Advisory Committee (PPAC) was formed in 2018 and was tasked with strategizing improvements to parking conditions in the City.

To further assess the existing parking demand within the SAD, the City's Community Development Office conducted 89 separate off-street parking lot counts of the City-owned lots and 32 separate on-street parking counts of the entire SAD. Of these, 43 off-street counts and 29 on-street counts were conducted during the work week over the course of six months at various times of the day. The remaining counts were conducted on weekends and the utilization rates observed during these weekend counts were considerably less than those observed during the week. The results of these extensive parking counts indicate a total of 820 publicly available spaces (on and off street) in the SAD and an existing peak public parking demand of 542 spaces (66.1% peak utilization rate) during the weekday 1:00 – 2:00 p.m. peak hour; leaving 278 public parking spaces available.

After the completion of the DAIP, the public parking utilization within the SAD is expected to increase by 1.7% (approximately 20 fewer unoccupied spaces during peak utilization) to 67.8%. Under this condition there would continue to be more than 250 available public parking spaces (during the weekday 1:00-2:00 p.m. peak), with additional spaces available at other times of the day and on weekends.

The City's anticipates completion of construction of additional spaces at the APMPP and the BSMPL expansion prior to groundbreaking on the DLMUD. The developer will provide parking for construction-related demand on the DLMUD site during the construction process.

Public parking spaces at the DLMUD, on Durkee Street, and those to be implemented via the BSPI will not be available for use during construction of these three projects. During the DLMUD's construction, there will be a minimum of 691 publicly accessible spaces located within the SAD. The peak parking demand within the SAD is 542 spaces; therefore, there would be sufficient public parking capacity to accommodate peak public parking demand during the DLMUD's construction.

The City will also authorize and designate long-term parking locations within the SAD. The City will temporarily designate certain areas on Broad Street, Oak Street, Couch Street, Brinkerhoff Street, Court Street, and the BSMPL as long-term parking for the

duration of construction of the DLMUD, DRSI, and BSPI. This will further alleviate any short-term inconvenience to the public including employees, business owners and residents of downtown. Those on-street areas selected for designation as long-term parking will be those deemed least likely to affect on-street parking availability near downtown businesses.

The City has been reviewing proposed changes to its snow ban parking system. In August 2019 the PPAC approved a recommendation to the Common Council that, once construction of the DLMUD commences, a new snow ban parking system be implemented that will utilize four City-owned off-street lots: the APMPP, the BSMPL, the City Hall Place lot, and the Court Street lot. The specific order of lot plowing in the proposed system is to be determined by DPW based on prevailing conditions during and after each snow event with public notice provided by the existing light system. These recommendations are currently under consideration by the Common Council.

Although the DAIP will eliminate all but 50 of the parking spaces currently available at the DSMPL and certain other parking spaces, the remaining DAIP will provide sufficient onstreet parking and parking spaces in multiple lots which will be closer to many of the uses within the downtown area. This will mitigate any loss of particular parking spaces and advance the revitalization goals of the City. The Common Council is currently considering the recommendations of the PPAC for various parking management strategies and no specific change has been adopted. Impacts to parking during construction of the DLMUD will be temporary and will be adequately mitigated by the measures described above.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on parking and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.6 Fiscal and Economic Conditions

The DAIP projects are proposed on lands currently owned by the City of Plattsburgh; including two projects (DRSI and BSPI) that are located within the City's roadway network. All projects not located within the aforementioned right-of-way are sites which are currently occupied by existing public parking, park, or other recreational uses, and vacant buildings. All of the project sites are currently owned by the City and wholly exempt from City, County, and Plattsburgh City School District (PCSD) taxes, with the exception of sites subject to the SAD. No property tax revenues are accrued or collected by the taxing jurisdictions (City, Clinton County, and PCSD) from any of the project sites under

the existing condition, and the project sites do not create substantial demand for municipal services.

It is estimated that the DLMUD will require \$71,509.24 annually in municipal service expenditures. Prime has requested a tax abatement from Clinton County Industrial Development Agency (CCIDA). Based on application materials provided by CCIDA, no PILOT payments are proposed in years 1 through 3 (from the date of issuance of a certificate of occupancy). Payments associated with the residential components will subsequently escalate as follows:

- Year 4-10 \$1,100 per apartment
- Year 11 to 15 \$1,300 per apartment
- Year 16-20 \$1,500 per apartment

The ground floor retail and/or commercial space will be tax exempt years 1 through 5. The PILOT would be assessed thereafter at \$2 per SF for years 6 to 10 and \$3/SF for years 11 to 20. The application to the Clinton County IDA also requests further incentives including sales tax abatement on project construction and acquisition estimated at \$680,000 as well as relief from the Mortgage Recording Tax (estimated at \$165,000). These abatements are standard incentives provided by Clinton County IDA. Prime and the DLMUD must meet the CCIDA's requirements to receive these incentives.

The City's average PILOT revenue over the initial ten-year period (Years 4-13) is projected to be \$43,912.13 annually. When added to the additional municipal revenues (e.g. public safety fees, transportation, licenses and permits, and fines and forfeitures) the total new DLMUD — related revenue from the PILOT and additional municipal revenues equals \$50,961.53. This results in a negative net fiscal impact of \$20,547.71 annually (\$71,509.24 - 50,961.53 = \$20,547.71) to the City.

Based on data provided by ESRI's Retail Marketplace Profile and Business Mapping capabilities, it was determined that it is reasonable to assume that 25% of Annual Per Unit Spending (APUS) will occur within the City. The new household spending in the City of Plattsburgh is estimated to be \$841,513 per year. Based on the \$841,513 in new household spending per year, additional sales (\$1,113,120) and new jobs (11) and wages (\$378,720) will be created, including 9 new jobs at retailers within the City, along with \$284,718 in new earnings. As these retailers and their employees make additional purchases, 2 indirect jobs, \$94,003 in earnings, and \$271,608 in sales are anticipated to occur.

In bringing new commercial space and residential units to the area, this project is contributing to making the City a place where residents and visitors want to spend their time. Direct impacts will result from on-site operations (employment and spending) as well as from new household spending by tenants. It is anticipated that approximately 32 new jobs⁶ will be present on-site with wages totaling \$997,375 and new expenditures of nearly \$2.6 million occurring. As the businesses make purchases from suppliers and employees spend their earnings, a portion of this will also occur within the City. This is referred to as the indirect impact and will result in an additional 7 jobs, \$291,738 in earnings, and \$841,412 in sales.

Investment of this scale tends to attract additional investment, as the City becomes a more desirable place to live, work, and visit. The addition of 115 new households creates a new market for existing retailers within the City, and creates opportunities for additional retailers to move in. The result will be a more vibrant downtown area, which will expend dividends for the community for years to come.

As noted previously, all other DAIP will be located on City-owned lands and will be owned and maintained by the City and will remain wholly tax exempt; no tax revenues would be generated, consistent with the existing condition.

According to the DLMUD developer (Prime), rents on the market rate apartment units are expected to start around \$1,200/month. Using a widely accepted methodology and demographic multipliers for New York State from Rutgers University⁷, the total number of new school age children will be approximately 22 or an average increase of 1.7 students per grade.

The addition of 22 new students would result in \$239,931 in new expenses to the PCSD⁸ with a corresponding increase of \$240,380 in annual state aid. Accordingly, the per pupil revenue from state aid covers the anticipated per pupil expenses. Beginning in year 5, the school district will receive \$81,178 in PILOT revenue under the most recent schedule- a positive net impact of \$81,626.

⁶ Note that when calculating the economic impacts of the commercial space, the impacts are adjusted to account for the portion of demand that results from new household spending. This adjustment means that 32 of the 35 jobs are considered to be net new and that 32 new jobs are used as the direct impact in the economic impact model.

⁷ "Residential Demographic Multipliers for NY," Rutgers University, June 2006. All multipliers are based on multifamily developments with 5+ units in NYS. Multipliers for 1-bedroom units are based on rent of \$1,000+, 2-bedroom units are based on rent of \$1,100+, and 3-bedroom units are based on rent of \$1,250+.

⁸ Fixed costs such as administrative and facilities costs that are not impacted by the number of students are not included in this analysis.

Although application of models to calculate projected costs and revenues can be subject to discrepancies depending on specific circumstances, it can reasonably be expected that the addition of the DLMUD to the tax rolls will offset costs to the City. In addition, the contribution of the DLMUD to attracting additional residential and commercial uses will advance the City's efforts to revitalize the City.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on fiscal and economic conditions and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.7 Historic and Cultural Resources

The eight project sites are located within or near to the National and State Register of Historic Places Eligible DPHD, which the NYSOPRHP finds to be "architecturally and historically significant as a largely intact City business core, reflecting the growth and development of Plattsburgh as a regional commercial hub and industrial center from the early nineteenth to the mid twentieth century." The area also served a role in the Battle of Plattsburgh, which ended the final invasion of the United States by the British during the War of 1812.

The APMPP and WPI are located within the DPHD. The DLMUD, the Riverwalk, DRSI, BSPI, BSMPL, and Building 4 at 26 Green Street are all located outside the DPHD. The DLMUD, DRSI, BPSI, and Riverwalk are considered to be substantially contiguous to the DPHD. All of the sites are located within an area that is considered to be sensitive for archaeologically sensitive resources.

A Phase 1A Archaeological Survey (A Literature Search and Sensitivity Study or Phase 1A) was completed for the DLMUD and Riverwalk in June 2019. According to the Phase 1A Report, the riverside area adjacent to the Saranac River within the APE has been extensively filled and previously disturbed by the construction and razing of buildings, and the paving over of the razed site and the construction of the present-day PFCM building.

The DRSI and BSPI projects will occur wholly within the existing right-of-way, an area that has been previously disturbed, and are not located within the DPHD. The projects would occur next to structures identified as eligible for listing on the National and State Registers of Historic Places, including: 17 and 31 Durkee Street, Veterans' Bridge, and 21, 25-31, and 33 Bridge Street.

The former Glens Falls National Bank building and proposed APMPP site are located within the DPHD, which is eligible for listing on the National and State Register of Historic Places. The Former Glens Falls National Bank building is not listed as a contributing resource, and the proposed demolition would not result in significant adverse impacts to the DPHD because the building is not considered a contributing resource.

Westelcom Park is located within the DPHD, which is eligible for listing on the National and State Registers of Historic Places and is included as a site that is eligible for listing on the Registers, though that eligibility is based upon the presence of structures on the site which have previously been demolished..

The existing BSMPL is not included within the DPHD and there are no National or State Register of Historic Places Eligible or Listed resources on or located substantially contiguous to the site.

The City proposes to relocate the PFCM from its current location to Building 4 at 26 Green Street in the City's Harborside Area. This building is part of a group of buildings that comprise the PMLD campus all of which (including 26 Green Street, USN 01940.001366) were classified as not eligible for listing on the State Historic Register by NYSOPRHP on September 12, 2019. Building 4 at 26 Green Street, and other PMLD buildings, are not included in the National and State Register Listed D & H Railroad Complex (90NR00182) but are included within an area that is considered to be archaeologically sensitive according to CRIS. In 2003, an archaeological survey (03PR05681) was conducted for the Harborside Area. The survey does not identify any resources associated with the historic railyard on the PMLD campus in the area of Building 4 at 26 Green Street.

In an October 17, 2019 letter, NYOPRHP requested a Phase IA Archaeological Survey for all portions of the project that will involve ground disturbance, as well as additional materials to define the project components.

The requested materials were submitted to NYSOPRHP in November 2019, including a Phase 1A completed by Hudson Valley Cultural Resources Consultants (HVCRC) and architectural design detail related to the DLMUD project. The HVCRC Phase 1A concluded that due to significant previous episodes of ground disturbance no archaeological resources will be adversely impacted by the various project sites and that no further archaeological investigation is warranted.

NYSOPRHP provided a December 23, 2019 response letter indicating "Based upon our review the reports prepared by Curtin Archaeological Consulting, Inc (Curtin & Dymond, June 2019) and Hudson Valley Cultural Resource Consultants (Selig, October 2019) and the response to our request for additional information/clarifications about the project, it is

the opinion of the New York SHPO that this undertaking will result in No Adverse Effect to historic properties, including archaeological and /or historic resources."

The project design for the DLMUD is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, which encourages contemporary design for additions to existing properties, rather than engaging in repetition of the past. The DLMUD design does not seek to replicate any of the surrounding architectural styles but intentionally incorporates contemporary elements that reflect the neighborhood's existing character to accomplish an interesting urban dynamic. The proposed primary massing scale is similar in height to the existing four, three, and two-story buildings to the west and located within this area of the City's downtown. As more specifically discussed in Sections 2.1 and 2.9, use of recognized architectural principles will ensure that the DLMUD is compatible with the downtown area of the City and the surrounding buildings while at the same time revitalizing this area of the City with modern development to facilitate a walkable downtown core.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on historic and cultural resources and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.8 Environmental Contamination

In March 2007, NYSDEC issued a Record of Decision (ROD) for the restoration of the Plattsburgh Gateway Project/Durkee Street Site identified as being located at 14 Bridge Street and that occupies part of the DLMUD project site. Remediation of the site was completed, and a Certificate of Completion was issued by NYSDEC on September 13, 2016 documenting this milestone and requiring the City to implement a Site Management Plan (SMP). The SMP stipulates the future use of the property is subject to institutional and engineering controls including an environmental easement.

The environmental easement was executed on November 9, 2011 by the NYSDEC for 1) 14 Durkee Street, 207.20-7-15 (4.38 acres) and 2) Broad Street (0.72 acres) to ensure protection of human health and to achieve the requirements for remediation. According to the easement, the property may be used for Restricted Residential as described in 6

NYCRR Part 375-1.8(g)(2)(ii)⁹, Commercial as described in 6 NYCRR Part 375-1.8(g)(2)(iii)¹⁰, and Industrial as described in 6 NYCRR Part 375-I.8(g)(2)(iv)¹¹.

The Engineering /Institutional Controls affecting the DLMUD site are summarized below:

- The use and development of the property are limited to restricted residential, commercial, or industrial use, as described in 6 NYCRR Part 375-I.8(g)(2).
- Compliance with the approved SMP is required.
- The use of groundwater as a source of potable or process water is not allowed, without necessary water quality treatment as determined by NYSDOH.
- The property owner must submit a periodic certification of institutional and engineering controls to the NYSDEC.
- The NYSDEC must be notified of any ground intrusive work or change in use and the proposed management of the final cover system, which will be required to restrict excavation below the pavement layer, or buildings.
- Any excavated topsoil is required to be tested and properly handled to protect the health and safety of workers and the nearby community and managed in a manner acceptable to the NYSDEC.
- An evaluation of the potential for vapor intrusion for any buildings developed on the project site is required, including provision of mitigation of any impacts identified.
- Monitoring of groundwater is required.
- Monitoring of the installed sub-slab vapor mitigation system in the office building presently under construction is required.

⁹ Per 6 NYCRR Part 375-1.8(g)(2)(ii), "Restricted-residential use" which is the land use category which shall only be considered when there is common ownership or a single owner/managing entity of the site. Restricted residential use: (a) shall, at a minimum, include restrictions which prohibit: (1) any vegetable gardens on a site, although community vegetable gardens may be considered with Department approval; and (2) single family housing; and (b) includes active recreational uses, which are public uses with a reasonable potential for soil contact.

¹⁰ Per 6 NYCRR Part 375-1.8(g)(2)(iii), "Commercial use" which is the land use category which shall only be considered for the primary purpose of buying, selling or trading of merchandise or services. Commercial use includes passive recreational uses, which are public uses with limited potential for soil contact.

¹¹ Per 6 NYCRR Part 375-I.8(g)(2)(iv), "Industrial use" which is the land use category which shall only be considered for the primary purpose of manufacturing, production, fabrication or assembly processes and ancillary services. Industrial use does not include any recreational component.

The redevelopment of the DLMUD will require a Change of Use notification and ongoing coordination with the NYSDEC to ensure the proposed project design and construction will not adversely affect the health and safety of local residents, workers, visitors, or construction workers. A Health and Safety Plan is required to be implemented during construction.

The future owners of the property are required to comply with the terms and conditions of the SMP. As indicated above, these include measures related to the excavation and handling of soils during construction, and installation of a sub-slab vapor barrier system. According to NYSDEC, there are no public exposure risks at the project site. Future exposure risks are limited to construction workers performing ground intrusive work at the site. Construction work must be conducted using a Health and Safety Plan to minimize exposures.

In a December 10, 2018 letter, the NYSDEC stated, "no further groundwater monitoring is necessary at the location; site groundwater contaminants show a decreasing contaminant trend and are just slightly above groundwater standards, groundwater is not utilized in the area, and the monitoring wells are becoming aged and in disrepair. Proper decommissioning of all monitoring wells is required, and a monitor well decommissioning report must be submitted to the Department. This work can occur in 2019 with the return of warmer weather." Decommissioning of all monitoring wells on the DSMPL was completed in November of 2019 and a well decommissioning report was submitted to NYSDEC.

As part of the SMP, the site must undergo periodic review every year and the current review and associated certification was accepted as stated in a July 2, 2019 letter from NYSDEC. The next review is due on March 16, 2020.

The former Highway Oil site (located within the DLMUD site) included three underground and one above ground petroleum storage tanks which were removed in 2014. In a June 25, 2019 letter the NYSDEC confirmed that no additional investigation or cleanup work is required at the former Highway Oil site.

At the APMPP site, ACM and lead paint are known to be present at the former bank building and drive-through canopy (built in 1967). Prior to demolition the building will undergo abatement for ACM and lead paint.

Building 4, the proposed location of the PFCM, is part of the PMLD State Superfund site. Environmental investigations have been completed on-site and found the groundwater is contaminated. Municipal water and sewer infrastructure are available on-site; therefore, no interaction with contaminated groundwater will occur. The former rail yard area

located immediately south and southeast of the project site has been the subject of Voluntary Cleanup and Brownfield Cleanup Programs administered by NYSDEC, which included the construction of the parking lot and elements of the remedial action work plan. The City has plans to cover the plant's influent channel and primary clarifiers to provide better containment of odors in the Harborside Area. Prior to the covering of the influent channel, it is anticipated that, during the PFCM's operating hours, use of the WRRF's influent channel will be suspended to minimize the effect of odors on nearby areas.

Demolition and construction activities related to the development of the proposed projects may result in dust emissions. However, these impacts are expected to be temporary and short-term and fugitive dust control plans will be required as part of the contract specifications.

New York State Electric and Gas Corporation (NYSEG) has begun remediation work involving the removal and disposal of coal-tar contaminated sediment in the Saranac River riverbed related to the former site of the Saranac Street manufactured gas plant located south of the study area on the opposite side of the Saranac River. Portions of this multiyear NYSEG project adjacent to the Riverwalk are anticipated to be completed by 2021. NYSEG's remediation of the Saranac River is not expected to adversely impact the project sites or the proposed projects themselves. Construction activities associated with the proposed projects will be coordinated with NYSEG to ensure health and safety conditions are not adversely affected and to ensure efficiency and timeliness during the overall construction period.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on environmental contamination and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.9 Recreation and Open Space

The City has a diverse series of parks and recreation facilities, including nearly 20 park facilities providing users with a wide variety of facilities, experiences, and access to waterfront and open space. Within walking distance to the DSMPL are Westelcom Park, MacDonough Park, Champlain Park, The City Marina and Peace Point Park, Hamilton Street Park, Lakeview Park at Soldiers Point, and Trinity Park. The City also owns and operates The City Recreation Center at the Old Base, providing a wide variety of programs and recreation and exercise opportunities.

The DAIP will not directly impact or displace any open space or recreation facilities. Except for the DLMUD, no new demand for parks and recreation facilities is anticipated.

Two of the projects, the WPI and Riverwalk, will improve and/or expand recreational opportunities.

The planned Riverwalk adjacent to the DLMUD and Saranac River includes an improved public ten-foot-wide walkway with an overlook and landscape plantings that will accommodate pedestrians and bicycles. It will provide connectivity to MacDonough Park to the north via a crosswalk over Bridge Street, and to the SRTG to the south via a path to be constructed between the Gateway Office Building and Broad Street that will connect to the existing sidewalk at the intersection of Broad and Durkee Streets. Upon conveyance of part of the DLMUD to the developer, the City will retain ownership of the waterfront and ensure public access to the waterfront via a pedestrian corridor connecting Durkee Street to the proposed Riverwalk, which will serve as both a physical and visual connection to the Riverwalk and Saranac River from points west. Easements and shared access agreements will be entered into by the City and the developer to ensure public access to and enjoyment of these features. The City will also retain and improve the Riverwalk from Broad Street to Bridge Street along the Saranac River.

The WPI will result in a multi-tiered park with sculpture areas, a water feature, a plaza, bicycle infrastructure, and pedestrian walking areas with landscaping throughout. The WPI will improve pedestrian connection from Durkee Street to the downtown core and provide expanded opportunity for exposure to arts and entertainment spaces as well as a park for respite.

The DLMUD will include certain amenities for the private use of residents including outdoor recreation (provided within the courtyard), office, and gym space. It is anticipated that new residents will primarily utilize existing facilities in the downtown and within walking distance to Durkee Street.

The DLMUD will also include planned refurbishing of the of the current Plattsburgh Farmers' and Crafters' Market (PFCM) building for use as a 3,400 SF commercial space and a 2,400 SF, publicly accessible civic space in an open-air pavilion with access from the new pedestrian walkway. This facility may be used for public gatherings or other commercial uses permitted under the City's Code. These public and semi-public areas will be accessed through the Riverwalk or the public access easement that is being provided through the project site.

The overall effect of the DAIP will be to increase recreational opportunities in the City which is a significant component of the City's revitalization effort.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on recreation and open space and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

2.10 Visual Resources

The area located within ¼ mile of the DAIP is comprised of an urban environment that includes a diverse mix of land uses that make up the Downtown and Harborside Areas, with the Saranac River as the dividing feature. In general, the project sites represent underutilized sites, interrupting the surrounding built urban context, including paved parking lots (the DLMUD and BSMPL sites), a deteriorated path along the bank of the Saranac River (the Riverwalk site), and vacant buildings (the APMPP and PFCM relocation sites). Two of the project sites comprise City streets (the DRSI and BSPI sites), and the WPI site is occupied by Westelcom Park.

The DAIP will enhance the visual resources of the area: the DLMUD will fill an existing void in the urban fabric with a new building that will complement the built context, and the remaining proposed projects will create a more visual appealing streetscape.

The design of the DLMUD was developed to incorporate compatibility with visual resources, including enhancing the overall fabric of the downtown through restoration of the street edges along Durkee and Bridge Streets; and maintaining sensitivity to the Durkee and Bridge Street contexts in terms of scale, building character, materials, color, fenestration, and detailing. With regard to the downtown fabric, the new DLMUD building will reestablish street edges and maintain setback lines similar to existing buildings to the west and north. Less attractive parking uses are concealed by placing them either below the building or within the interior courtyard. The entire eastern edge of the basement parking deck will be enclosed and screened by a heavily landscaped base, with a landscaped buffer that will blend with the Riverwalk treatment.

With regard to design sensitivity, the primary massing scale is similar in height to the existing four, three, and two-story buildings to the west. The strong cornice lines at the corners and along both streets reinforces the relationship. The mid-block and end sections of the building will step back above the fourth level to reduce the visual scale along both streets and the Riverwalk. The north side of the building will step down another level at the northeast corner to parallel the street slope and further reduce its visual impact.

In keeping with the neighborhood scale of varied and clustered building facades, the proposed DLMUD building will be articulated in five sections: the two corner sections will be clad in masonry and metal paneling with bracketed cornices to differentiate them from the Bridge Street and midblock Durkee Street sections, and the end and midblock sections will have punched balcony openings to create a more unified and sympathetic façade for the neighborhood and minimize the visibility of the balconies.

The new DLMUD building will employ a variety of visual elements sympathetic to many other downtown buildings, including a mix of building materials, punched openings, stone sill and lintel aesthetic, opening proportions similar in scale, larger ground level glazing for commercial uses, and strong cornice expression. The DLMUD will not impact or obstruct views of the Saranac River and lighting will be installed consistent with City code and addressed during site plan review.

The remaining DAIP will support and work to integrate the revitalization effects of the DLMUD throughout the area by improving park and open space resources, streetscapes, and parking opportunities. The projects will undergo future coordination with applicable City Boards and Commission to ensure consistency with public policy as it pertains to visual resources.

Based on the foregoing, the DGEIS, FGEIS and related documents, the City Council finds that the DAIP will not create any significant adverse environmental impacts on visual resources and will avoid or minimize adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable. No mitigation is required.

3.0 ALTERNATIVES

Pursuant to SEQRA regulations, the GEIS must describe and evaluate "the range of reasonable alternatives to the action that are feasible, considering the objectives and capabilities of the project sponsor"; a No Action Alternative must be evaluated. Three alternatives to the Action were identified that meet these criteria: the "No Action Alternative," a "Planned DLMUD with Downtown Parking Garage at Broad Street", and the "Reduced Residential Count and Increased Commercial Square Feet" alternative. These three alternatives are described and evaluated below.

3.1 "No-Action" Alternative

The No Action Alternative is an alternative that is required by the SEQRA regulations. This Alternative assumes that none of the DAIP would be undertaken, and that each project site would remain in its current conditions.

Under the No-Build Alternative, there would be no physical changes to any of the project sites.

- No construction related impacts
- No soil disturbance
- No increase in vehicular traffic
- No additional water or wastewater usage or solid waste generation
- No loss of parking at the DSMPL
- No new school aged children
- No new residents
- No new employees
- No additional tax revenues
- No additional housing choices downtown
- Project sites would remain underutilized, with no improvements to the visual character of the project sites or surrounding area
- No effect on drainage
- No streetscape improvements or parking improvements on Durkee Street, Bridge Street, or the Riverwalk
- DSMPL, BSMPL, Riverwalk, APMPP and Westelcom Park would continue to contribute to the Parking SAD
- Building 4 at 26 Green Street would likely be demolished and its former footprint would be considered as part of the Master Plan being pursued for that area of the City.

The DAIP are being undertaken to support downtown revitalization in the City, as facilitated by the DRI award the City was awarded by NYS in 2019. The No Action Alternative does not address the needs, goals, and objectives of the City. The No Action Alternative would not build upon recent public and private investments in the City, would not generate new temporary and permanent jobs, and would not increase downtown revenue or meet the goals of the City's DRI for the site, and, therefore, is not a feasible alternative, considering the City's objectives.

3.2 Alternative B: Planned DLMUD with Downtown Parking Garage at Broad Street

Under this alternative the DLMUD project would go forward as planned along with the associated DAIP and the City would construct a 250-space parking structure downtown at the BSMPL site. The benefit of this alternative is that any parking displaced by the use of the DSMPL would be provided at a central location similar to is current location. However, the parking garage may obstruct views to the Saranac River and would likely require significant architectural façade treatments to be visually consistent with the DPHD and other historic buildings located nearby. In addition, this Alternative would have similar impacts as the proposed projects, with additional project costs and minor traffic impacts.

Structured parking costs between \$22,000 and \$25,000 per unit. A 250-unit parking garage would cost on the order of \$5.5 and \$6.25M and may not qualify for NYS aid. The garage would be owned and operated by the City of Plattsburgh, and it is anticipated parking fees would be implemented to offset debt service and annual operation and maintenance costs.

In total, this Alternative would result in similar construction and utility impacts, while resulting in:

- Additional traffic downtown
- Additional project cost of \$6.25M
- Additional parking fees

This Alternative is not consistent with the City's objectives and capabilities. The City would be required to seek grant funding and/or invest tax dollars to fund the construction of the garage. Some of the costs could be recouped with the imposition of fees for parking and these costs would be assumed by residents, business owners and patrons to downtown. The cost of constructing a parking garage would likely result in the City charging parking fees far in excess of those fees which might otherwise be imposed in order to recoup its expenses.

3.3 Alternative C: Reduced Residential Count and Increased Commercial Square Feet

Under this Alternative, the DSMPL would be redeveloped with the preliminary development program identified in the Plattsburgh DRI Strategic Plan (45 residential units and approximately 47,000 SF of retail and/or commercial space), in lieu of the current

DLMUD proposed for the site as part of the proposed project. The remaining components of the proposed project (the Riverwalk, DRSI, BSPI, APMPP, WPI, BSMPL, and PFCM) would remain unchanged under this alternative.

This Alternative would result in:

- Fewer residents (92 vs. 236) and students (12 vs. 22) and less associated recreation/open space demand;
- More employees;
- Additional traffic generation and parking usage.
- Additional parking supply and demand would occur under this alternative. Based on the parking requirements in the City's Zoning Ordinance, 45 residential units would require 82 parking spaces¹² and 47,000 SF of retail and/or commercial space would require 284 parking spaces¹³ for a total of 366 parking spaces. The ITE Manual anticipates a demand of 364 parking spaces for this Alternative.¹⁴ If parking were provided at a rate consistent with the proposed project, it is estimated that a total of 339 parking spaces¹⁵ would be provided under this Alternative. This may require construction of a parking structure. Similar to the proposed project, the current parking provided at the DSMPL would be displaced and provided on the other project sites. Moreover, with the increased commercial area there would be greater (overlapping) competition for available parking spaces during peak parking periods.
- Less water demand: Of the 45 units, assuming a similar breakdown to the proposed project, 45% or 20 units would be one-bedroom units, 51% or 23 would

¹² §360-26 of the City's Zoning Ordinance requires two spaces per dwelling unit (DU) for first 10, 1.75 spaces for each additional DU over 10. Therefore, 45 residential units would require: 20 spaces + 62 spaces = total 82 parking spaces.

¹³ The City requires 1 space per 50 SF of customer area and 1 space per 250 SF of other area for restaurant uses. Assuming 10,000 SF would be allocated to restaurant space, with 60% or 6,000 SF used for customer space, a total of 136 parking spaces (120 parking space + 16 parking spaces) would be required for the restaurant use. The City requires 1 space per 250 SF of retail and/or commercial space so the remaining 37,000 SF of retail and/or commercial space would require 148 parking spaces.

¹⁴ Using the more conservative scenario (85th Percentile), 1.2 space demand is anticipated per unit, 17.4 space demand per 1,000 SF of restaurant use, and a 3.68 space demand per 1,000 SF of retail use results in a total demand of 364 parking spaces.

¹⁵ 1.5 spaces per 47 dwelling units = 71 parking spaces; 1 space per 250 SF of 37,000 SF of retail space = 148 parking spaces; 1 space per 50 SF of 6,000 SF of customer restaurant area = 120 parking spaces. Total parking spaces = 339 parking spaces.

be two-bedroom units and 4% or 2 would be three-bedroom units. A total of 7,920 gpd of water demand would be generated for the 72 bedrooms. Assuming 10,000 SF of restaurant space (with 60% or 6,000 SF used for customer space) and 37,000 SF of retail space, this Alternative would result in 3,700 gpd of water demand for the retail use and 14,000 gpd for the restaurant use. The total demand and generation would be 25,620 gpd.¹⁶

- Less solid waste generation: This Alternative is anticipated to include 92 residents for 45 units, 10,000 SF of restaurant space of which 6,000 SF is used for customer area, and 37,000 SF of retail space. The Alternative would result in 4.7 tons of solid waste generation per day or 144.8 tons per month.¹⁷
- Short-term construction impacts would be similar to the proposed project and Alternative B.
- Reduced fiscal and economic impacts: Construction of this Alternative would result
 in similar project costs but a reduced financial return resulting in a project that is
 less economically viable. As a result, the provision of public amenities on-site may
 be reduced. This reduction would result in less public interest in and visitation to
 the downtown area and lesser downtown revenue.

As this Alternative would generate fewer jobs and less downtown and tax revenue, it would meet to a lesser degree the needs, goals, and objectives of the City, while similarly resulting in short-term construction impacts. This alternative would not significantly minimize impacts and would fall short of the City's expectations for revitalization.

4.0 ADVERSE UNAVOIDABLE IMPACTS

The proposed project will have some adverse impacts on the environment that cannot be avoided if the project is implemented. Most of these are short term impacts that will occur primarily during construction. The impacts that cannot be avoided will be mitigated through reduction to the greatest extent practicable through implementation of best management practices, proper engineering, and design. Unavoidable impacts are as follows:

 $^{^{16}}$ In accordance with the NYSDEC Design Standards for Intermediate Sized Wastewater Treatment Systems, the hydraulic loading rate is 110 gallons per day (gpd) per bedroom, 0.1 gpd per square foot of commercial space, and 35 gpd per seat in restaurant space. Restaurant seating is estimated using 1 seat per 15 sq. ft of customer space. 17 45 units x 2.048 = 92 residents. 92 residents x 0.00175 tons per resident per day = 0.161 tons per day. 11 meals per day x 400 seats = 4,400 meals per day. 4,400 meals x 2lbs per meal = 8,800 lbs per day or 4.4 tons per day. 37,000 SF or retail / 1,000 SF x 3 = 111 employees. 111 employees x 0.001 = 0.111 tons per day. Total solid waste generated per day = 4.7 tons per day or 144.8 tons per month.

- Disturbance of the sites during construction for grading, construction, paving, and landscaping;
- Generation of traffic. During the construction phase, trucks, machine transport, supply vehicles, and work crew vehicles would add to the present traffic. Once the development is complete, there will be additional vehicle trips generated by new residents, employees, and patrons and an increase in vehicle generated exhausts/pollutants. Traffic operations will be maintained at current or satisfactory LOS;
- Increase in dust particles generated during construction;
- Increase in water usage and wastewater generation;
- Increase in solid wastes during construction and as a result of new residents;
- Increase in lighting generated at the site and energy usage;

The DLMUD will provide approximately 236 new residents living downtown. It is anticipated that new residents will have a significant positive impact on downtown business; creating additional demand for food, entertainment, and retail goods. The DLMUD's residential component is anticipated to generate 4 FTE, and the restaurant and retail component will create demand for approximately 32 additional employees. In total, the DLMUD's total annual economic impact on the City, which is the combination of both the impacts of on-site employment and new household spending, is expected to comprise 48 jobs, \$1,667,832 in earnings, and over \$4.5 million in sales.

Overall, as discussed in the GEIS, these unavoidable impacts are not considered significant adverse impacts and no further mitigation beyond that previously described in the Findings is required. In addition, the impacts identified are outweighed by the social and economic benefits the DAIP will provide to the Plattsburgh community.

5.0 IRREVERSIBLE IRRETRIEVABLE COMMITMENT OF RESOURCES

The DAIP are proposed for sites that are previously disturbed and located within an urban environment. Nevertheless, the various improvement projects would require the commitment and use of a variety of resources, which would no longer be available for future use. Construction related materials, including concrete, wood, steel, and fill materials and construction equipment operation utilizing water and fossil fuels would be irreversibly and irretrievably committed to the projects. The projects, in their operational state, would irreversibly and irretrievably utilize water and fossil fuels. Labor resources,

during construction and operation, would be committed to the proposed projects, but this is anticipated to result in a beneficial impact.

6.0 CUMULATIVE GROWTH INDUCING ASPECTS

Growth inducing aspects beyond the proposed project limits may occur as a result of the DLMUD. The DLMUD will provide 236 new residents living downtown, which is anticipated to induce downtown business growth for entertainment and necessities. This may induce the need for additional goods and services and new employees. These are seen as positive impacts as the goal of the proposed project is to aid in the revitalization of downtown consistent with the community's DRI vision.

The DLMUD's residential component is anticipated to generate 4 FTE, and the restaurant and retail component will create demand for approximately 32 new employees, which in turn may spur further residential demand and local economic revitalization. In total, the DLMUD's total annual economic impact on the City, which is the combination of both the impacts of on-site employment and new household spending, is expected to comprise 48 jobs, \$1,667,832 in earnings, and over \$4.5 million in sales. In addition, the total economic impacts of the DLMUD's construction equates to 56 jobs, nearly \$2.2 million in earnings, and over \$5.5 million in new sales in the City of Plattsburgh. The Riverwalk and WPI projects may also attract new visitors, tourists, and residents which will contribute to the development of a more desirable community that in turn will attract new residents and businesses.

The streetscape and parking improvement projects would not result in cumulative growth inducing aspects but, similar to above, should be acknowledged as they will contribute to the development of a more desirable community which in turn will attract new residents and businesses.

The relocation of the PFCM to Building 4 and 26 Green Street may allow for increased patronage of the PFCM. The City was recently awarded grant funding to complete a Master Plan for this area, which is likely to consider strategies to induce cumulative growth in this area as well.

As the goal of the City's revitalization efforts is to encourage growth, these are considered positive impacts of the DAIP.

7.0 ENERGY RESOURCES

7.1 Effects on the Use and Conservation of Energy Resources

As with all development projects, energy will be consumed during construction and will continue to be consumed once the proposed projects are operational. The main energy sources used by the proposed projects will be electricity and natural gas. During construction of the proposed projects, energy will be used to power equipment and various construction vehicles. Once construction is completed and the sites are operational, energy will be required for lighting at all of the project sites and for the day-to-day use of residences and commercial uses that comprise the DLMUD.

The design and plans for all energy-related systems amongst the various projects will require compliance with the NYS Energy Construction Code and standards. The DLMUD is anticipated to use modern efficient fixtures and designs including low flow plumbing, high-efficiency lighting, and high-efficiency heating/cooling.

By following best practices for erosion and sediment control and stormwater management practices and through the increase in landscaping, the proposed projects will reduce effects on energy resources.

In 2018, DEC adopted a new section 617.9 (b) (5) (iii) (i) that requires, "where relevant and significant," an EIS must discuss "measures to avoid or reduce both an action's impacts on climate change and associated impacts due to the effects of climate change such as sea level rise and flooding." The proposed projects are not located within the regulatory floodplain or a NYSDEC-mapped Coastal Erosion Hazard Area, and the project area is unlikely to be subject to flooding or storm surge. Furthermore, the projects are not anticipated to result in a significant amount of projected Greenhouse Gas Emissions (GHG) emissions. Therefore, a climate change analysis is not required.

8.0 FUTURE SEQR ACTIONS

Future development proposals should be consistent with the criteria specified in this Findings Statement prepared for the GEIS. These criteria include the mitigation measures discussed for each environmental issue. Failure to provide mitigation for potential adverse impacts will require further SEQR action to justify the lack of mitigation.

In the event subsequent proposed actions were adequately addressed in the GEIS but not adequately addressed in the findings statement, an amended findings statement must be prepared. If subsequent proposed actions were not addressed or not adequately addressed in the GEIS and the subsequent actions will not result in any significant environmental impacts, then SEQR only requires that a negative declaration be prepared.

SEQR requires a supplemental EIS to an FGEIS if the subsequent proposed action was not addressed or was not adequately addressed in the GEIS and the subsequent action may have one or more significant adverse environmental impacts.

As future development is proposed within the City, the subject Lead/Involved Agency for each proposed action will be responsible for carrying out the requirements of SEQR. This will require the Lead/Involved Agency to interpret the Statement of Findings prepared by the City, as it specifically relates to the development being proposed. To provide the Lead/Involved Agency with sufficient documentation to compare the parameters and impacts of a site specific project with the Findings Statement, each project that is subject to SEQR (Unlisted or Type 1) must prepare a Full Environmental Assessment Form.

9.0 CERTIFICATION

The Common Council recognizes the essential need to revitalize the Downtown and Harborside areas of the City and has been advancing efforts to do so for some time. It also respects the importance of doing so in an environmentally responsible manner. In reviewing the potential environmental impacts of the proposed DAIP, the Common Council has followed the mandates of SEQRA and prepared an extensive GEIS and received comments both at a Public Hearing and in writing. The Common Council has reviewed all of the information provided for the proposed DAIP in the GEIS, including comments on the potential environmental impacts of the DAIP made by the public and other Involved and Interested Agencies and the responses to those comments. These Findings give due consideration to, and represent a reasonable and proper balancing of, potential environmental impacts with social, economic and other relevant considerations in confirming the demonstrated public need and benefit of the DAIP, its lack of significant adverse environmental impacts and its avoidance of impacts by project design, location and mitigation.

Upon consideration of the foregoing and the Draft and Final Generic Environmental Impact Statements, the Common Council of the City of Plattsburgh hereby certifies that:

A. It has considered the relevant environmental impacts, facts and conclusions disclosed in the Draft and Final Generic Environmental Impact Statements prepared in connection with the proposed action.

- B. It has weighed and balanced the relevant environmental impacts with the social, economic and other essential considerations relating to the proposed action.
- C. The requirements of 6 NYCCR Part 617 have been met.
- D. Consistent with social, economic and other essential considerations from among the reasonable alternatives available, the action is one that avoids or minimizes adverse environmental impacts to the maximum extent practicable, and adverse environmental impacts will be avoided or minimized to the maximum extent practicable by incorporating as conditions to the decision those mitigative measures that were identified as practicable in the Draft and Final Generic Impact Statements and this Findings Statement.

Mayor Colin L. Read